DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY LOWER BOARDMAN RIVER LEADERSHIP TEAM Wednesday, November 28, 5:30p.m. 400 Boardman Avenue, Lower Level Cafeteria, Traverse City, MI 49684 <u>www.downtowntc.com</u>

Information and minutes are available from the DDA CEO, 303 East State Street, Suite C, Traverse City, MI 49684, (231) 922-2050. If you are planning to attend the meeting and are handicapped requiring special assistance; please notify the DDA CEO as soon as possible.

- 1. Meeting Minutes of November 20, 2018
- 2. Review of Evaluations --- Request for Qualifications
- 3. Public Comment
- 4. Adjournment

Any interested person or group may address the Leadership Team on any agenda item when recognized by the presiding officer or upon request of any Leadership Team member. Also, any interested person or group may address the Leadership Team on any matter of concerning the Lower Boardman River not on the Agenda during the agenda item designated Public Comment. The comment of any member of the public or any special interest group may be limited in time. Such limitation shall not be less than three minutes unless otherwise explained by the presiding officer, subject to appeal by the Leadership Team.

Office of the Downtown Development Authority, 303 E. State Street, Traverse City, MI 49684 (231) 922-2050

DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY LOWER BOARDMAN RIVER LEADERSHIP TEAM Tuesday, November 20, 2018, 12:30 p.m. City Opera House 106 E. Front Street Traverse City, MI 49684 www.downtowntc.com

Co-Harry Burkholder called the meeting to order at 12:41 p.m.

- Present:Harry Burkholder, Christine Crissman, Jean Derenzy, Frank Dituri, Tim Ervin,
Brett Fessell, Michele Howard, Jennifer Jay, Russ Soyring, Mike Vickery
- Absent: Elise Crafts, Deni Scrudato, Rick Korndorfer
- **DDA Staff:** Colleen Paveglio
- Other: Great Lakes Fisheries Commission: Andrew Muir, Dan Zielinski, and Marc Gaden
- 1. Meeting Minutes: The meeting minutes from October 24, 2018 were approved as amended upon motion by Soyring, seconded by Vickery. Motion carried unanimously.
- 2. Introductions of Great Lakes Fisheries Commission staff, DDA Board Members, and Lower Boardman River Leadership Team
- 3. Overview of FishPass Project
 - a. Projection instruction with Dr. Andrew Muir, Great Lakes Fisheries Commission
 - i. GLFC & Sea Lamprey Control
 - 1. Management Challenge
 - ii. What is FishPass?
 - iii. What will FishPass do?
 - 1. Replace
 - 2. Optimize technologies and techniques below a barrier
 - 3. Develop living laboratory
 - 4. Covert to a permanent fish way
 - iv. Why Boardman?
 - 1. Boardman River restoration timeline and Union Street Dam disrepair, meeting criteria
 - v. Project Feasibility
 - 1. Partnerships and Support, and Expert Judgement
 - 2. Interest locally, federally, and globally

- vi. Project Design Timeline
- vii. Discussion on the innovation of the project, the evaluation process regarding success, objectives, and long term maintenance/operation
- b. Union Street Dam FishPass Overview with Dr. Dan Zielinski, Great Lakes Fisheries Commission
 - i. Eco-Engineering Approach
 - ii. Research Plan
 - 1. Phase 1: What species are present and what are their sortable attributes
 - 2. Phase 2: Applied research stage and test technologies and techniques
 - 3. Phase 3: How can selective fish passage improve watershed connectivity and improve fishery management
 - iii. Potential Technologies
 - iv. Project Overview:
 - 1. Development of an Advisory Board & Science Team
 - 2. Stakeholder Engagement
 - 3. Project Funding: To date and Future
- 4. Overview of Outreach and Education Plan for FishPass Project
 - a. Communication & Engagement Update Dr. Marc Gaden
 - b. Leadership Team Comments
 - i. Vickery commented on assessment of site and partnerships for education and ecology
 - ii. Soyring commented on the site with public access and connectivity to Hannah Park, American Legion Park, and Lay Park.
 - iii. Burkholder commented on working assumptions and vision statements
- 5. Overview of Lower Boardman River Unified Plan
- 6. Discussion of Aligned Visions and Objectives
 - a. Great Lakes Fisheries Commission staff to review the visions and statements and provide feedback on how the statements can align with the FishPass Project
- 7. Funding Opportunities
 - a. Great Lakes Fisheries Trust grant was not awarded
 - b. \$20,000 secured for the project currently and seeking another \$20,000
- 8. Overview Process for RFQ responses
 - a. Evaluation sheet for the two proposals are due Wednesday, November 21 to Jean Derenzy
- 9. Other Business
 - a. Future Meeting Schedule:
 - i. November 28, 2018: Special Meeting

- ii. December 5, 2018: Interviews and meeting to provide recommendation to DDA Board of Directors at their December 14, 2018 meeting.
- 10. Public Comment
 - a. Tom Mair, 612 5th Street, commented on access and co-existence with the many users of the river
 - b. John Nelson, 4022 Incochee, commented on the FishPassage area and the educational components including The Ottaway
 - c. Charlie Weaver, Kalkaska, commented on kayak access pointsi. Two access points are being planned and one ADA compliant
 - d. Beth Milligan, 603 3rd Street, inquired on next steps specially getting to the design, funding, and breaking ground
 - Funding resources will continue to worked with and on track for construction to begin in 2020. Construction to last for 24 months. 65% design will be reviewed by Army Corp. and DEQ and April or May for 90% design. Currently have \$12 Million
 - e. Charlie Weaver, Kalkalska, inquired if stakeholder groups beyond anglers have been consulted and commented on native species and materials being used in the project.
- 11. Adjournment. The meeting officially adjourned at 2:01 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Colleen Paveglio

The Traverse City Downtown Development Authority does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission or access to, or treatment or employment in, its programs or activities. The DDA CEO has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the DDA office.



Downtown Development Authority 303 E. State Street Traverse City, MI 49684 downtowntc.com jean@downtowntc.com 231-922-2050

Memorandum

To:	Lower Boardman River Leadership Team
From:	Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Date:	November 26, 2018
Re:	RFQ Evaluations

Attached is the summary of all evaluations received from the Leadership Team. The evaluations are important as they identify the differences within each proposal from individual team members. This also helps form appropriate questions to help determine why the firm is being recommended. I have highlighted in green the areas that have the most varying differences from team members being: Visions, Comprehension, Civic Engagement, Understanding & Awareness and Cost/Schedule. For team members that have not submitted their evaluations, please submit to me.

For the Wednesday, November 28th meeting, I am asking for board members general feedback on the proposals and areas you wish for me, as well as Tim Ervin, to focus on when developing the questions.

Both firms are scheduled for interviews for Wednesday, December 5th beginning at 9:30am in the Governmental Center Committee Room (Second Floor). This will be a meeting of the Lower Boardman River Leadership Team, with interviews open to the public. Please plan on being at the December 5th meeting 15 minutes ahead of time to receive the questions being asked.

It is anticipated, after the interviews are completed, that the Leadership Team will be recommending a firm to the DDA board. This recommendation will be considered by the DDA at their Friday, December 14th meeting.

Should you have any questions prior to the Wednesday meeting, feel free to contact me.

SUMMARY OF EVALUATIONS

Questions	Evaluator 1		Evaluator 2		Evaluator 3		Evaluator 4		Evaluator 5	Evalu	Evaluator 6		Evaluator 7	
	Biohabitats	SmithGroup	BioHabitats	SmithGroup	BioHabitats	SmithGroup	BioHabitats	SmithGroup	BioHabitats SmithGroup	BioHabitats	SmithGroup	BioHabitats	SmithGroup	
Clarity	5	5 7	10	7	10	10	10	10	10	0 9	9	8	6	
Assumptions	5	5 7	10	8	10	10	8	10	10	7 9	9	8	7	
Visions	5	5 7	10	8	10	8	8	10	10	5 7	7	9	5	
Comprehension	7	7 10	9	6	10	10	10	10	10	5 7	7	7	6	
Civic Engagement	7	7 7	10	10	10	7	10	10	10	5 9	6	9	4	
Overall Qualifications	5	5 7	9	10	10	10	10	10	10	7 8	9	8	9	
Individual Qualifications	7	7 10	10	10	10	10	10	8	10	5 9	9	8	9	
Organizational Qualifications														
& Experience	5	5 7	9	9	10	9	8	8	10	7 9	10	8	9	
Understanding & Awareness	5	5 7	10	9	10	8	8	8	10	7 8	10	9	5	
Identify /develop Systems	5	5 7	10	10	10	10	8	8	10	8	10	9	9	
Understanding ways to														
Preserve & Protect	5	5 7	10	9	10	10	8	8	10	10 10	9	9	7	
Overall Scope of Work	7		10		9	8	10	10		7 8		8	7	
Demonstration of														
Qualifications	5	5 7	10	10	10	10	8	8	7	7 9	10	8	9	
Cost/Schedule	3				5	5	5	10	10	7 8		3	8	
TOTAL	76	5 102	135	124	134	125	121	128	137	9 118	121	111	100	
	Biohabitats	Smith Group												
Clarity	62	2 59												
Assumptions	60	58												
Visions	59	50												
Comprehension	60) 54												
Civic Engagement	65	5 49												
Overall Qualifications	60	62												
Individuals Qualifications	64	4 61												
Organizational Qualificaitons														
& Experience	59	9 59												
Understanding & Awareness	60) 54												
Identify/develop Systems	60	64												
Understanding ways to														
Preserve & Protect	62	2 60												
Overall Scope of Work	62													
Demonstration of														
Qualifications	57	7 61												
Cost/Schedule	42													
TOTAL	832													
							1		I I	1				