DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE AGENDA
January 3, 2019, 11:00 a.m.
2nd Floor Committee Room
Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Ave, Traverse City
www.downtowntc.com

Information and minutes are available from the DDA CEO, 303 East State Street, Suite C, Traverse City, MI 49684, (231) 922-2050. If you are planning to attend the meeting and are handicapped requiring special assistance; please notify the DDA CEO as soon as possible. Any interested person or group may address the DDA Board on any agenda item when recognized by the presiding officer or upon request of any DDA Board member. Also, any interested person or group may address the DDA Board on any matter concerning the DDA not on the Agenda during the agenda item designated Public Comment. The comment of any member of the public or any special interest group may be limited in time. Such limitation shall not be less than five minutes unless otherwise explained by the presiding officer, subject to appeal by the DDA Board.

1. Roll Call

2. Consideration of minutes of the November 28, 2018 Subcommittee Meeting (Approval Recommended)

3. Destination Downtown
   A. Destination Downtown Agreement (TDM 3 Yr. Plan)
   B. Establish Destination Downtown Program Fees
   C. Bayline Contribution

4. High and Low Impact Event Lot Rental Rates

5. Committee Review of Transportation Demand Management 3 Year Plan
   A. Residential Parking (TDM)

6. Merchant Citation Fund

7. Parking Violation and Fine Amounts
   A. $5 Meter Violation/Same Day Discount
   B. Review/Compare Violation Fine Amounts (TDM)

8. Valet Parking Ordinance (TDM 3 Yr. Plan)

9. Traffic Committee Update
   A. Overnight Parking Pilot

10. Introduction to February Agenda
    A. Parking Contract and Budget
    B. Meter Bag Policy
    C. Event Rate for Metered Lots
    D. Metered Beach Lots
    E. Bay Street Parking

11. Public Comment

12. Adjournment

The Traverse City Downtown Development Authority does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission or access to, or treatment or employment in, its programs or activities. The DDA CEO has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the DDA office.

DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE MINUTES

Thursday, November 29, 2018, 11:00 a.m.

DDA CEO, Jean Derenzy, called the meeting to order at 11:17 AM

Present: Steve Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, Scott Hardy, Todd Knaus, Rick Brown, Debbie Hershey, Jeff Joubran

Absent:

Derenzy called for nominations for Chair.

1) Nomination of Chair: **Motion by Constantin, second by Joubran to nominate Scott Hardy as Chair of the Parking Subcommittee. Motion carried unanimously.**

Meeting turned over to Chair Hardy.

A. Hardy asked committee members to introduce themselves and why they are interested in serving on the committee.
B. Joubran is a local, serves on the DDA Board, lives in Central Neighborhood with his family and owns Sweet Pea, and he and his family are involved in the community.
C. Hershey is a 10 year resident who resides in Midtown. She serves on the DDA Board, Arts Commission and Film Festival Sign Manager. She is interested in parking as she is not impacted since she is close enough to walk everywhere.
D. Brown is a native of Indianapolis who has been a resident of Traverse City for 3 years. He has over 30 years of planning experience, serves on the Parks Commission and is an avid walker and cyclist.
E. Knaus is the VP of Facilities and Fleet for Hagerty Insurance and sits on the River's Edge Condo Board. Hagerty is the largest downtown employer whose campus is sprawling in downtown, and they are supportive of development and changes downtown.
F. Hardy serves on the DDA Board, is a downtown resident of Boardman Neighborhood, his wife is a downtown business owner, he has served on many boards and committees over the years, and he is a lifelong resident.
G. Jackson first visited Traverse City in 1939, he and his wife moved to their downtown home in Central Neighborhood in 2001. He has served on many board and committees over the years.
H. Constantin is a 14 year resident who resides in Midtown. He is more of an observer than a user as he mostly walks. He is interested in the behavior change and shared his experience of living in Switzerland.

2) DDA Parking Subcommittee Orientation Presentation

A. Presentation by Nicole VanNess, Parking Director providing an overview of the Current Mission Statement, History, Auto Parking System Enterprise Fund, Budget, Organization Overview, Operations by Department, Space Management, Areas Managed, Additional Non-parking Initiatives, Overview of Current 3 Year Plan, Objectives in Progress, Overview of Parking Master Plan, and Next Steps.

3) TDM 3 Year Plan Overview
   A. VanNess reviewed years 1 and 2 of the TDM 3 Year Plan. A recommendation to continue the Destination Downtown program will be provided at the next meeting.
   B. VanNess asked the Committee to review the TDM Final Report and Appendices that were handed out in preparation for the next meeting so the 3 Year Plan could be updated.

4) Recurring Meeting Schedule Discussion

   A. VanNess asked for the meetings to take place the first Thursday of every month so action items could be included in the DDA Board packet for their meetings which occur every third Friday of the month.
   B. Committee unanimously agreed to the suggestion. The meetings will take place every 1st Thursday of the month at 11 AM at the Gov Center in the 2nd Floor Committee Room.

5) Committee Member Comment
   A. Joubran shared concerns that the parking plan will not remain relevant without retail. The customer experience is crucial.
   B. Hershey suggested looking into a circulator or shuttle to help with the perceived walking distance.
   C. Derenzy provided an overview of Groundworks Mobile app.
   D. Brown suggested looking into a residential permit program that benefits residents.
   E. Hardy shared that retail is impulsive. Changes to the system will need to include benefits that accommodate the impulse.
   F. Constantin would like information related to time limits that could accommodate downtown patrons, and would like to see valet parking as an option for shoppers who are willing to pay and not worry about parking
   G. Derenzy asked the committee to confirm that we provide additional information as it relates to solutions for residents and retail shoppers.

6) Public Comment. No public comment.

7) Adjournment. The meeting officially adjourned at 1:00 PM.

_____
Scott Hardy, Chair

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: Destination Downtown

Destination Downtown Agreement
We launched our first pilot commuter benefit program on June 25, 2018. Similar programs had been discussed, but not put into motion. The program is a benefit that employer's within the DDA District can offer their employees, and is an employer or employee's alternative to paying for a parking permit and parking downtown. Auto Parking Funds are used to cover the cost of rides for all commuter passes on eligible City Loop and Village Loop fixed routes within the Bay Area Transportation Authority's network.

Leading up to the launch we met with Ann Arbor's GoPass! program coordinators for advice based on their lessons learned after having gone through three revisions of their program. To assist with the marketing and promotion of the program, the DDA applied for a Rotary Seed Grant and was awarded $10,000. We ultimately determined our primary goal was continued increase ridership. The more we can get parkers to commit to commuting the more we are reducing the need to provide long-term parking for employees and are able to increase utilization of these spaces for short-term parking for retail and recreation.

BATA provides a monthly report for weekly ridership. We evaluate total rides, number of passes used more than 5 times, number of passes used more than 3 times, and total passes used. Industry data shows that commuter benefit programs rarely have a 100% rider usage rate. This is due to family commitments, appointments, errands, etc. We determined 5 rides per week to be the benchmark for full-time employees and 3 rides per week to be the benchmark for part-time employees. In the 23 weeks the pilot has operated, we are averaging 17 unique riders, 6 full-time riders, 4 part-time riders and 75 rides per week. We do not have exact rider behavior and pattern data. Based on the assumption that all riders are roundtrip commuters, we are reducing our need for 38 long-term parking spaces per week. This equates to the same number of parking spaces in Lot J off of Union at the Sixth Street Dam.

The pilot will expire on February 28, 2019. In preparation for a full program launch, we have formalized a program policy that further defines program details which include an employer coordinator and usage guidelines for participants. We continue to see consistent usage and feel as though this program is a great benefit for employers and their employees, and will continue to

grow as the demographics of downtown evolve. Upon approving the annual agreement, we will review the 2018-2019 funds budgeted for the pilot program and adjust as deemed necessary for the 2019-2020 budget.

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee recommends the DDA Board approve the Destination Downtown Agreement with Bay Area Transportation Authority to be effective March 1, 2019-February 29, 2020 subject to content approval by the City Attorney.

Establish Destination Downtown Program Fees
The program will have annual operating expenses for marketing materials, passes, and overall program management. We will absorb all personnel operating costs with our current parking staff, but feel as though the employer should have a small buy-in to the program. We have determined a nominal participation fee, as well as, a per pass fee. The fees will help to offset ongoing marketing materials, consumables and expenses.

Employer Participation Fees
The fee is based on the number of employees on the employer's payroll.

- 1-25 employees $25
- 26-75 employees $50
- 76+ employees $100

Destination Downtown Pass Fees

- New Pass $5
- Replacement Pass $10
- Lost/Stolen Pass $15

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee recommends the DDA Board approve and establish the recommended Employer Participation Fees and Pass Fees as presented.

Bayline Contribution
In 2018-2019 we budgeted for a $10,000 contribution to BATA's new fare-free Bayline route that looped east to west and through downtown. The route has been extremely successful with higher than anticipated ridership. To-date, there have been over 76,000 rides which includes patrons and employees of downtown. Transportation industry data equates every 1.54 rides to 49,000 trips of cars being taken off the road which is a huge success in reducing traffic in our east-west corridors. We believe this route is an asset to our community and huge benefit to downtown.

We had budgeted $25,000 towards the reimbursement of Destination Downtown ridership. We have not yet had to use the budgeted funds, and are estimated to be below budget come the end of the fiscal year. We are recommending an additional contribution to the Bayline route to show our continued support of commuter partnerships, and the value alternative transportation plays in our community.

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee recommends the DDA Board approve an additional contribution to Bay Area Transportation Authority in the amount of 5,000 for the Bayline Route.

PURCHASE OF PASSENGER FARE AGREEMENT

THE BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (the Authority, herein referred to as "BATA"), 3233 Cass Road, Traverse City, Michigan 49684, and the TRAVERSE CITY DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY, (the Purchaser, hereinafter referred to as "DDA"), 303 East State Street, Traverse City, Michigan 49684, in consideration of the mutual promises contained herein, do hereby agree as follows:

1. TERM

The annual~~initial~~ term of this Agreement is ~~June 25, 2018-February 28, 2019~~March 1, 2019-February 29, 2020 for the ~~pilot~~ commuter benefit program to be known as "Destination Downtown." ~~Following the initial term, the program may be continued by the parties upon mutual agreement.~~The program shall renew annually unless terminated no less than the first day of February of each renewal year.

2. PURPOSE OF AGREEMENT

The recognized purpose of the ~~pilot~~ Destination Downtown program is:

- Recognize the lasting relationship between BATA and the DDA,
- Reduce demand for downtown parking,
- Increase sustainability of transportation,
- Increase the use of transit service by downtown employees within the DDA District,
- Reduce the cost of travel and parking for downtown employees within the DDA District,
- Allow the parties to evaluate and gather information regarding the pilot program.

3. SERVICE PROVIDED

BATA and the DDA have agreed to support a ~~pilot~~ commuter benefit program to be known as "Destination Downtown" to manage the transportation demand created by the increased demand for the parking downtown. BATA will provide Destination Downtown Cards to the DDA to travel on all BATA fixed route buses. The DDA will distribute the Destination Downtown Cards to downtown employees by marketing the ~~pilot~~ program to employers within the DDA District. Downtown employees must swipe their issued valid Destination Downtown Card through the fare box. BATA will collect data on each boarding and provide such information to the DDA monthly.

4. DESIGNATED REPRESENTATIVES

The DDA agrees to designate a representative as its agent to work in cooperation with designated representatives of BATA, overseeing the conduct of this service, modifications thereto and evaluation thereof. Nothing herein will be construed to limit the legal powers of BATA or of the governing body of any governmental unit.

5. FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

5.1 Payments by Purchaser

DDA agrees to reimburse BATA an amount equal to 100% of full-adult cash fare ($1.50 for City Loops/$3.00 for Village Loops), per boarding for individuals with a valid Destination Downtown Card for the Term of the Agreement.

BATA will provide data files to the DDA collected from the magnetic strip or RFID chip on the Destination Downtown Card with the following information:

- ~~Date and time of swipe~~Usage by Pass Number
- ~~Location (latitude/longitude) of the swipe~~Usage by Route
- Total Passes Used
- Total Rides by Week or Month
- Total Uses by Pass
- ~~Route and Direction~~

BATA shall submit invoices to the DDA once per month, on or about the fifth day of each month for the contract term. DDA agrees to pay the amount for the total number of boardings for a given month according to its customary policies for payment of invoices.

5.2 Financial Assumptions, Power of Authority to Modify Services

It is expressly understood by the parties that the charges to the DDA are based on the BATA's adult cash fare ($1.50 for City Loops and $3.00 for Village Loops).

5.3 Fares

It is expressly understood that determination of fare levels and all policies relating to fare collection and administration will be the responsibility of BATA and are based on BATA's current fare structure.

5.4 Bulk Fare Consideration

A bulk fare rate discount of 20% will be applied if the predetermined threshold of 24,277 rides has been reached during the ~~initial~~ term of this Agreement to all rides exceeding 24,277. If ridership data projects this threshold will be met in subsequent years of the agreement, the 20% discount will be applied for the full year in advance.

6. EQUIPMENT

BATA will provide all hardware (including Destination Downtown Cards) and vehicles necessary for the service to be rendered hereunder, will maintain said equipment and will retain ownership of said equipment.

7. PERSONNEL

BATA will provide the personnel necessary to fulfill its obligation hereunder, and retains complete authority in hiring, regulation and termination of said personnel. The DDA will provide the personnel necessary to administer the ~~pilot~~ Destination Downtown program.

The relationship of the parties is that of independent contractors and in accordance therewith, the parties covenant and agree to conduct themselves consistent with such status and that neither they nor their employees~~-~~, officers or agents will claim to be an officer, employee or

agent of the other party or make any claim, demand or application to or for any rights or privileges applicable to any officer or employee of same, including but not limited to worker's compensation coverage, unemployment insurance benefits, social security coverage, or retirement membership or credit. The parties do not intend the services provided by the Consultant to be a joint venture.

8. INDEMNIFICATION

BATA will indemnify the DDA and hold the DDA harmless from all claims, suits, actions and damages resulting from operation of vehicles conducted by the Authority under this Agreement except to the extent that such damages are caused by the DDA. It is not the intent of BATA to waive any governmental immunity otherwise available to it. DDA, subject to any governmental immunity available to it, will indemnify and hold BATA harmless from all claims, suits, actions, and damages caused by its officers, agents or employees to the extent of its insurance coverage, except to the extent caused by BATA.

9. ASSIGNMENT

This Agreement shall not be assigned by either party without the written consent of the other.

10. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY

The parties agree not to discriminate against an employee or applicant for employment with respect to hire, tenure, terms, conditions or privileges of employment, or a matter directly or indirectly related to employment because of their actual or perceived race, color, religion, national origin, sex, age, height, weight, marital status, physical or mental disability, family status, sexual orientation, or gender identity. Breach of this covenant may be regarded as a material breach of this Agreement.

11. MODIFICATION OF AGREEMENT

This contract may be modified in writing by mutual agreement of the parties.

12. EVIDENCE OF INSURANCE

BATA shall obtain and maintain during the term of this Agreement the following insurance:

a. Workers compensation insurance with Michigan statutory limits and employer's liability insurance with minimum limits of $500,000 each accident.

b. Public liability insurance with limits of no less than $1,000,000 each occurrence and aggregate for bodily injury and property damage, as well as an umbrella policy with limits no less than $5,000,000. The DDA is named as additional insured as respects general liability claims resulting from the operation of the Bay Area Transportation Authority. The policy of insurance must be current and must be accompanied by a statement, which indicates that the policy shall not be canceled, without at least sixty (60) days prior notification to the DDA, of such cancellation.

c. Automobile liability insurance covering all owned, hired and non-owned vehicles, with personal protection insurance and property protection insurance to comply with the provisions of the Michigan No-Fault Insurance law, including residual liability insurance with minimum limits of $1,000,000 combined single limits bodily injury and/or property damage each accident. The policy of insurance must be current and must be accompanied by a statement, which indicates that the policy shall not be canceled, without at least (60) days prior notification to the DDA, of such cancellation.

BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

_____

Kelly Dunham
Executive Director

TRAVERSE CITY DOWTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

_____

Leah Badgon-McCallum~~William (Bill) Golden~~, DDA Chair

_____

Scott Hardy~~teve Constantin~~, Secretary

APPROVED AS TO SUBSTANCE

_____

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

_____

Lauren Trible-Laucht, DDA/City Attorney

DRAFT

Destination Downtown Program Overview

How the Destination Downtown Program Works

As a business within the Traverse City Downtown Development Authority (DDA) District Boundary you can offer the Destination Downtown Program to your employees. The Destination Downtown pass provides you and your employees with unlimited use of all Bay Area Transportation Authority (BATA) City Loop and Village Loop routes for the purpose of commuting to and from work. This is a commuter benefit which saves you and your employee from having to pay for parking while working downtown. The Auto Parking Fund covers the cost of each trip taken by the commuter.

Destination Downtown Program Coordinator

Coordinator Responsibilities

As a Destination Downtown Program participant, you must designate a Program Coordinator. To make this easier, you'll want someone on your staff to manage and promote the program to your staff. The Coordinator will also be the contact person between your company and our offices. The Coordinator must keep a list of all Destination Downtown pass numbers and the names of the employees who have been assigned passes. The list must be updated when passes are reassigned, employees depart, new employees are hired and when replacement pass numbers are assigned. We will provide informational materials that can be used to promote this commuter benefit program to your employees.

Keep track of your Destination Downtown Passes

- Destination Downtown passes are a benefit you give to your employees. They are your property, similar to building/store keys, parking passes, proximity cards or other items that you give to your employees while they are employed with you.
- Since the passes are your property, your Coordinator is required to keep track of the pass numbers and to which employees they have been assigned. The Destination Downtown pass number is located in the upper right-hand corner on the back of the pass.
- The pass should not leave your organization when your employee leaves. If an employee leaves, get the pass back from them so that it can be reassigned to a new employee. An employee should not be using a pass if they no longer work for you. We will check in throughout the year to verify employment for current pass holders.
- The Destination Downtown Program reserves the right to deactivate one or all of your passes if we find that you are not keeping track of who is getting what pass or if the

passes assigned to you are not being used appropriately within the DDA District for the purposes of commuting.

Program Participation

Participation Fee (required): To participate in the Destination Downtown program, you are required to pay an annual participation fee based on the number of full and part-time employees on your payroll including owners and managers. The participation fee gives you access to the Destination Downtown program a commuter benefit for your employees. If the number of your employees increases during the year, you will be charged the difference when you get to the next participation level.

*Participation Fees**

76+ employees $100
26-75 employees $50
1-25 employees $25

Destination Downtown Passes

Destination Downtown Pass Fee (required): You can order a Destination Downtown pass for all your employees or just some of your employees. You can choose to cover the pass fee or pass this fee on the employees. Each new pass you order will be $5. Your designated Program Coordinator is responsible for tracking the pass numbers that are issued to each employee, and obtaining returned passes from any employee who is no longer employed. Returned passes may be reassigned to a new employee. A replacement pass is required for any new pass that needs to be replaced when a pass is not returned from an existing employee. A lost/stolen pass replacement is required anytime an employee loses a pass.

*Pass Fees**

New Pass $5
Replacement Pass $10
Lost/Stolen Pass $15

*All participation fees and pass fees are non-refundable.

Frequently Asked Questions

Who at my organization can participate in the Destination Downtown program?

Any employee on the payroll who works at your location within the DDA District, including owners, managers, full-time and part-time employees.

Who cannot get a Destination Downtown pass?

- Employees at your organization cannot give or sell their Destination Downtown pass to anyone else. The pass should only be used by the employee it was given to and should never be given to a spouse, friend, child or anyone except the intended employee.
- Employees who work for the organization, but at a location that is outside of the DDA District.
- Organizations outside of the DDA District.

What if I hire new employees during the year?

You can get Destination Downtown passes at any time for new employees by filling out the Order Additional Destination Downtown Passes Form on our web-site. The cost to add a pass for a new employee is $5.

What if an employee leaves and takes a pass with them?

If you contact us, you will be charged a $10 fee to replace the pass. We will need the number of the pass that was not returned so we can deactivate the old pass before we can issue you a replacement pass. You can get replacement passes by filling out the Order Replacement Destination Downtown Passes Form on our web-site.

What if an employee's pass is lost or stolen?

You can fill out the Order Replacement Destination Downtown Passes Form to get a lost or stolen pass replaced. Lost/Stolen passes are $15 to replace. We will need the number of the lost or stolen pass to so we can deactivate the old pass before we can issue you a replacement.

What if an employee's pass is damaged?

Damaged passes can be replaced at no charge. You can fill out the Order Replacement Destination Downtown Passes Form to get a damaged pass replaced. We will need the damaged pass back before we can issue a replacement at no charge.

Destination Downtown Code of Conduct

DO'S

- Do use your pass to commute to and from work downtown only.
- Treat the Destination Downtown program like your property, similar to building/store keys, parking passes, proximity cards, etc.
- Keep track of all of your Destination Downtown pass numbers.
- Get Destination Downtown passes back from employees who no longer work for you. Notify our office when returned passes are reissued to new hires.
- Report lost/stolen/non-returned Destination Downtown passes to (231) 922-0241 or destination@downtowntc.com.

DON'TS

- Don't use your pass outside of your commute to and from work in downtown or for recreational pleasure.
- Give the pass to anyone else other than an eligible employee. The Destination Downtown Program reserves the right to deactivate and make invalid any Destination Downtown pass we believe is being misused by an employee. If we suspect abuse, this may jeopardize the Destination Downtown program for all your employees, and we may deactivate one or all of your Destination Downtown passes.
- Let your employees give their Destination Downtown pass to friends or family. If we find out this is happening, we may deactivate one or all of your Destination Downtown passes.
- Keep your passes if your organization closes or moves out of downtown. Contact us at 231-922-0241 or destination@downtowntc.com to let us know the passes should be deactivated.

DRAFT

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: High and Low Impact Event Lot Rental Rates

Every other year, the City Clerk's Office reviews the schedule of fees and makes adjustments as needed. We review and provide the information needed to adjust the High and Low Impact Event fees for the Parking Lot Rental Rates. It is important that we continue to review and evaluate the rates no less than every other year. This fee is applied to any event that that will operate in a parking lot with the exception of the National Cherry Festival and Traverse City Film Festival. Each time an event requires the use of a parking lot, we have to communicate the closure to the public and permit holders. Our permit lots are around 95% capacity and displacing a permit holder during the workweek usually results in frustration.

Our last event rate increase went into effect in May of 2016. The current event permit fees for use of the metered parking lots or parking garage and permit parking lots are $2.37/metered space, and $2.40/non-metered space.

Over the past two years, we have seen increased use of the parking spaces throughout the downtown area. We have calculated an increased per day rate based on actual revenues from December 2016-November 2017 and December 2017-November 2018. The formula we use to calculate per space per day fees for the metered areas is based on the total meter revenue, divided by the number of total spaces (801 parking lot metered spaces), divided by the number of enforceable metered days in a year (Monday-Saturday or 313 days). The formula we used to calculate per space per day fees for the permit surface lots is based on the 2017-2018 actual surface permit revenue, divided by the number of total spaces (364 for parking lot non-metered spaces), divided by the number of enforceable permit days in a year (Monday-Friday or 261 days).

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee recommend the DDA Board approves the increase of the parking lot event usage rates for High and Low Impact Events to $2.88 per space per day for metered lots, and $2.56 per space per day for non-metered lots.

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 27, 2018
Date: Transportation Demand Management – 3 Year Plan

Committee Review of Transportation Demand Management 3 Year Plan
During our Orientation Meeting, we reviewed the TDM 3 Year Plan. The plan is fluid, and will be updated as needed. There are items that are not listed as an annual objective that will be implemented as time allows or based on a similar objectives. I would like to obtain any additional comments or feedback to ensure our current objectives align with those of the Subcommittee.

Residential Parking
This topic is not a one-size fits all. Residential Parking is not an ordinance we are able to modify as it does not yet exist. I would recommend we breakdown residential parking into specific subtopics, and we determine a priority level and timeline to implement is a phased approach. Some subtopics are going to require feedback from Planning Commission and the Traffic Committee; scheduled public input sessions, ordinance development, consumables, informational materials, training, and more.

Committee Members Jackson and Hardy expressed interest in moving forward with the steps to implement the initial residential permit request that was made in 2001. The permits would allow residents to park past the posted time limit on residential streets. This request will require ordinance development to establish residential permits and define the number of permits that could be obtained by residents who reside on blocks with posted time limits. This subtopic should examine existing signage and include the process in which residents may request new signage.

Residential Parking has been a recurring topic since 2014. If the Subcommittee agrees with a phased approach, I will provide a breakdown of subtopics for review at our next meeting. The list can be prioritized and implemented individually rather than tackling as a one-size fits all.

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: Merchant Citation Fund

Last month we discussed the importance of retailers in the downtown district, and how discouraging it can be to receive a parking citation while shopping. Retailers are an important part of the make-up of a downtown, and in reviewing solutions we need to consider downtown residents, employees, restaurants, service businesses, offices, event venues and all who utilize the parking system.

I have looked into parking programs that allow residents discounted meter rates or a meter parking permit sticker, but have not been able to find any communities that currently offer this program. I am mostly finding traditional residential parking permit programs on non-metered residential streets. I will continue to explore and see what programs are out there.

Committee Member, Jeff Joubran, would like to review the suggestion to establish a Merchant Citation Fund. This would be an account that is made up of funds contributed by participating merchants. The funds would be used to pay for parking citations for customers of these businesses who receive citations while shopping as a way to say thank you and replace any negative feelings related to having received the citation. Many details would need to be defined and worked into a process before moving forward. If we decide to continue exploring this option, we will determine next steps following our discussion.

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 21, 2018
Date: Parking Violations and Fine Amounts

$5 Meter Violation/Same Day Discount
In July of 2017, we made a recommendation to reduce a discount of 50% to the base amount of all meter violations that are issued if the payment is made the same day in-person or online only. The purpose of the discount was to incentivize anyone who promptly paid their citations, and increase our collection rate with the goal to decrease the number of second notices generated with meter citations that would include maximum escalations for non-payment.

The ordinance changes became effective January 1, 2018. Second notices are generated no less than 45 days from citation issuance date. Our first batch of second notices that included partially paid meter violations was in March. Of the 329 notices, 30% or 98 notices were due to a $5 payment on the $10 balance. The notices were sent and upon receiving phone calls the escalation amounts ($20) were appealed to be reduced to the base amount if the additional $5 payment was received in our office. Our appeal call times average between 3-8 minutes per call. Based on the increase call volume, we implemented a pre-appeal process in April after 31% of the notices were due to $5 partial payments.

The pre-appeal process automatically placed the citations on open appeal, provided a courtesy letter communicating the new ordinance change, a copy of the ordinance language, and the offer to reduce escalation amounts after paying the remaining base amount. This process reduced the number of calls, but increased the call time as many were upset and verbally wanted to express their displeasure with the process. Placing citations on appeal increased staff time on notices to by 6-10 hours per month. Our checks and balances processes allow for two designated employees to have access to reduce fine amounts through the appeal process. This process increase our back-office staff time to review the open appeals, verify payments, and apply reductions by 3-6 hours per month.

We have continued to follow the pre-appeal process through the end of the year. As of today, we have issued 25,947 meter violations. We have generated and mailed 3,241 second notices. 871 or 27% of the second notices that have been mailed are the result the $5 partially paid meter violations, and 3% of the total meter violations issued year-to-date.

Nearly a year since implementing the change, the same day discount overall has increased our collection rate. Even with 27% of second notices for same day meter violations, our second notices decreased by 12% from the prior year. However, each month we have increased staff time for calls by 135-360 minutes, back-office processes by 9-16 hours, and printing and postage in order to collect the additional $5 balance and waive $20 of escalations. Based on this information, we would like to reconsider offering the same discount.

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee recommends the DDA Board approve an ordinance change to Section 488.06 (33) schedule of fines to remove the $5 if paid same date as date issued by midnight for online or in-office payments only from the meter violation fine schedule subject to content approval by the City Attorney.

Review/Compare Violation Fine Amounts
This is an item for introduction. One of the short-term priorities identified in the final report of the TDM was to refine escalating parking violation fine structure for overtime and non-payment violations. The fine amounts other than meter violations have not been reviewed in more than 15 years.

We recently performed a rate comparison with other Michigan communities of various sizes. By comparison, our violation fine amounts are below the average fine amounts statewide. I have attached the Parking Violation Rate Comparison sheet. Our fines are highlighted in green. Fines that are highlighted in red represent rates that are higher than ours, and fines highlighted in yellow represent rates that are lower than ours.

We are evaluating the timeline of recommendations we will be bringing to the Subcommittee over the next six months to determine if we will recommend all violations be increased as a whole or whether to increase violations in connection with specific recommendations.

Parking Violation Rate Comparison

(Rate Comparison performed November 2018)

	Expired Meter	Overnight Parking	Past Time Limit	Without Permit/Failure to Display	Improper Parking/Where Prohibited	Handicap
Traverse City	$10 $5 (within 24 hrs.) $10 (1 day) $20 (16+ days) $30 (31+ days)	$15 $15 (Initial) $30 (31+ days) $45 (60+ days) *Enforced 3am-6am	$10 $10 (Initial) $20 (16+ days) $30 (31-60 days)	$10 $10 (Initial) $20 (16+ days) $30 (31-60 days)	$15 $15 (Initial) $30 (31+ days) $45 (60+ days)	$100 $100 (Initial) $200 (31+ days)
Ann Arbor	$15 $15 (within 24 hrs.) $25 (1 day) $60 (14+ days) $70 (30+ days)	N/A *No overnight ordinance noted*	$25 $25 (within 24 hrs.) $35 (Fine) $55 (14+ days) $75 (30+ days) *Past time on signs & meters	$25 $25 (within 24 hrs.) $35 (Fine) $55 (14+ days) $75 (30+ days)	$25 $25 (within 24 hrs.) $35 (Fine) $55 (14+ days) $75 (30+ days)	$115 $115 (within 24 hrs.) $125 (Fine) $145 (14+ days) $165 (30+ days)
Birmingham	$10 $10 (Initial) $20 (10+ days)	$30 $30 (Initial) $40 (10+ days)	$10 $10 (Initial) $20 (10+ days)	N/A	$30 $30 (Initial) $40 (10+ days)	$100 $100 (Initial) $125 (10+ days)
Flint	$25 $25 Base	N/A	$25 $25 Citation	$45 $45 Citation	$45 $45 Citation	$145 $145 Citation
Grand Rapids	$20 $20 (1-10 days) $40 (11-90 days) $60 (91+ days) *Central City*	$30 $30 (1-10 days) $60 (11-90 days) $90 (91+ days) (*No parking posted hours, on street/Snow Routes- same fine)	$20 $20 (1-10 days) $40 (11-90 days) $60 (91+ days) *Central City*	$20 $20 (1-10 days) $40 (11-90 days) $60 (91+ days) *Central City*	$20 $20 (1-10 days) $40 (11-90 days) $60 (91+ days)	$100 $100 (1-10 days) $200 (11-90 days) $300 (91+ days)
Holland	N/A	$15 $15 (within 7 days) $20 (8-30 days) $30 (30+ days)	$10 $10 (within 7 days) $15 (8-30 days) $20 (30+ days) *Overtime violation in off-street lots	$15 $15 *Violation of Parking Deck Ordinance	$15 $15 (within 7 days) $20 (8-30 days) $30 (30+ days)	$75 $75 Citation
Lansing	$20 $10 ("Early Pay") $20 (Fine) $30 (14+ days) $40 (28+ days)	$20 $20 (Initial) $20 (14+ days) $29 (28+ days) *Enforced 2am-5am	$20 $20 (Initial) $30 (14+ days) $40 (28+ days)	$20 $20 (Initial) $30 (14+ days) $40 (28+ days)	$20 $20 (Initial) $30 (14+ days) $40 (28+ days)	$90 $90 (Initial) $100 (14+ days) $110 (28+ days)
Marquette	$15 $15 Citation *No escalation fees, boot w/4 unpaid citations	$75 $75 Citation *Enforced Nov. 1 - May 1	$25 $25 Citation *No escalation fees, boot w/4 unpaid citations	$25 $25 Citation *No escalation fees, boot w/4 unpaid citations	$25 $25 Citation *No escalation fees, boot w/4 unpaid citations	$100 $100 Citation *No escalation fees, boot w/4 unpaid citations
Midland	$10 $10 *Per offense	$30 $30 *Enforced 3am-6am	$10 $10 *Per offense	$15 $15 *Per offense	N/A	N/A
Monroe	$10 $10 *Doubled after 5 days	$25 $25 *Violating 28hr. Parking ordinance/hourly time limit in residential	$25 $25 Citation	N/A	$15 $15 *Any Improper violation	$100 $100 Citation
Petoskey	$5 Warning (1st Citation) $5 (1-4 Citations) $15 (5-9 Citations) $30 (10+ Citations)	N/A N/A *Handled by Public Works	$20 $20 Citation *Any citation- Escalation policy 8+days overdue +$20 14+days overdue +$50 30+days overdue +$80 60+days overdue +$120 90+days overdue +$220	N/A	$25 $25 Citation *Any citation- Escalation policy 8+days overdue +$20 14+days overdue +$50 30+days overdue +$80 60+days overdue +$120 90+days overdue +$220	$50 $50 (1st Citation) $100 (2nd Citation)
Rochester	$10 $10 (1-14 days) $40 (14+ days)	$30 $30 (1-14days) $60 (14+ days) *Enforced 2am-6am	$20 $20 (1-14 days) $50 (14+ days)	$30 $30 (1-14 days) $60 (14+ days) *Restricted Parking-No Residential Permit	$30 $30 (1-14 days) $60 (14+ days)	$100 $100 (1-14 days) $200 (14+ days)
Saginaw	N/A	$25 $25 Initial $50 10+ days *Enforced 3am-6am	$15 $15 Initial $30 10+ days	N/A	$25 $25 Initial $50 10+ days	$150 $150 Initial $200 10+ days

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: Valet Parking Ordinance

We identified a public valet program as one of our TDM (Transportation Demand Management) year one objectives. The goal of the objective is to provide an optional service to the public for patrons who would like to take advantage of valet services, reduce the perception that there is no available parking, and alleviate traffic congestion for those circling the block looking for parking. Many cities have ordinances related to valet operations. In order to evaluate the valet program and determine if valet operations are viable in our area, three downtown businesses partnered to support a pilot valet program which took place over the summer months in 2018. The goal of the pilot was to help us to gain a better understanding of the utilization and demand prior to establishing an ordinance and licensing fees.

The 11 week valet pilot wrapped up Labor Day weekend. We reviewed the data captured by At Your Service Valet Company. The information showed fairly consistent utilization each night throughout the pilot timeframe. The only time the valet was not used was when the street or spaces were unavailable due to City sanctioned events. Patrons took advantage of the program for the State Theatre and other destinations aside from the three participating restaurants.

Aside from the use data, we obtained feedback from an advocacy groups, restaurants, retailers and an event venue. Overall, the discussed showed support for the valet so long as the operations do not conflict with designated bike lanes and valet signage does not impede or block existing business signage and outdoor cafes. Additional consideration should be given when operations are requesting use near businesses where noise from valet attendants or patrons could interfere with the operations of outdoor cafes or walk-up windows.

With the success of the pilot valet program, we are proceeding with the process to create the ordinance to allow for valet companies to operate. The ordinance will include license conditions, guidelines for use of the right-of-way, guidelines for use of the loading zone and metered spaces, a site plan for signage and podiums, and a parking plan. Considerations will be given to ensure Valet Operations will be compatible with the street designs determined by the Complete Streets process that is currently in-progress.

Our next steps will include reviewing the use and access of the public right-of-way with the Traffic Committee, and discussing necessary Traffic Control Orders that are needed to modify loading zone and meter zone time limits to allow for valet operations. Once these items are determined, the draft ordinance will be prepared. All application and license fees will need to be determined prior to the final draft of the ordinance goes to the DDA Board.

Valet Ordinance Overview

Valet License

All valet companies would be required to obtain a valet license to operate a valet in the City of Traverse City, city limits. The license is required for daily operations, as well as, single events.

Valet License Fee

The fee will be determined prior to the finalization of the ordinance language, and based on operation usage. Fees may vary by application. The application term will be determined prior to ordinance enactment.

Valet Application

The application is required to be submitted no less than two weeks from anticipation operation dates. Additional time may be required for any requests that need to be reviewed by the Traffic Committee. The application will identify the location where the valet intends to operate. This information must identify if the valet is operating on private property only or will operate within the public right-of-way. For valets who intend to operate within or use the right-of-way, the applicant must obtain signatures of support from businesses on the block face of the operation. The application must include days and times of the week the valet will operate.

Valet Application – Parking Plan

The Parking Plan must include a diagram depicting loading and unloading areas, and a map of the parking lots that will be used for parking vehicles. The applicant may request the use of the public right-of-way, loading zone or metered spaces. Any request of involving public space or the right-of-way will require the review of the Traffic Committee for issuance of the proper Traffic Control Orders. Additional fees may apply on a per request and use basis. Valet operations are not permitted to use metered spaces or public parking lots unless approved in the application.

Valet Application – Operations Site Plan

The Operations Site Plan must submit a diagram depicting signage, podiums, key storage boxes, etc. The site plan should identify a five foot sidewalk clearance for ADA compliance, signage placement (in-street, sidewalk, on-site), distances from existing light poles, meter posts, and sidewalk or in-street cafes.

Rejection of Application

The application may be rejected in part or in whole for not meeting requirements or for not providing sufficient documentation. Valet operations will not be permitted if they are likely to cause traffic congestion, plan to operate adjacent to a bike lane, cause an unnecessary threat to pedestrians or other general public safety. Applications may resubmitted after addressing rejected items.

Insurance

Upon approval of the application, the valet company must file their proof of insurance prior to commencing operations. Insurance should include workers' compensation as required by state law, General Liability, Garagekeepers' Legal Liability, and Automotive Liability. Any operations that will utilize the right-of-way are required to name the City of Traverse City as additionally insured.

DRAFT

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: Traffic Committee Update

The following is an overview of items that are currently under review or in-progress by the Traffic Committee. The purpose is to provide an update on parking related items that the Traffic Committee is working on in order to communicate between the two committees.

Overnight Parking Program Pilot
Residential parking has been under review since 2015. The Traffic Committee is waiting for additional feedback and recommendations from the Parking Subcommittee related to residential parking as a whole before considering ordinance changes. In the meantime, the Traffic Committee continues to receive requests from residents to allow for overnight parking on residential streets. The current ordinance prohibits parking between the hours of 3 AM-6 AM from November 15-April 15th, but allows for parking on Saturday and Sunday from April 15th-November 15th.

In November, the Traffic Committee discussed the need to determine an area for a small test case of even and odd overnight parking because of the amount of requests that are received. After consideration the Committee, approved implementing a pilot overnight parking program to satisfy the request and needs of the Bay Bread business owner. The morning employees arrive around 4 AM to begin baking. Over the course of the year, many are cited for overnight parking, because they are parking between the hours of 3 AM-6 AM. A letter has been sent to property owner adjacent to the north side of the alley on the 300 Blk of N Maple. The pilot will begin in January 2019, and run through April 15th. The pilot may end at any time with minimum notice if parkers are not following the designated even and odd sides of the street. At the conclusion of the pilot, the Parking Subcommittee and Traffic Committee should review and determine whether or not to proceed with an ordinance change or a formal overnight parking program.

Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: December 18, 2018
Date: Introduction to February Agenda

The following is an introduction into items that are planned for next month's agenda. This is not a complete list, but is meant to provide a quick overview for the items that will be discussed. Additional supporting details will be provided in the packet.

Parking Contract and Budget
In the Orientation Meeting, we touched on the percentage of revenues that are transferred to the City's General Fund and the three Departments of the Parking Operations. The DDA Parking Contract has always been a flat fee. The fee covers salaries and wages of all employees within the Parking Department. It is time that we review the fee to determine if it should allow for an annual percentage increase or be changed to allow billing based on actual expenses. In the budget, we will take a closer look at how the City Fee percentage was determined, and if the percentage should be adjusted or the percentage should exclude Hardy and Old Town Funds.

Meter Bag Policy
The Meter Bag Policy was last revised and made effective in June 2015. The revisions maintained the maximum limit to four meters, clarified guidelines, defined the billing process and increased the rate. As we continue to see an increase of visitors and patrons of downtown, we would like to review the policy to ensure the policy meets the intended purpose while cognizant of the needs of retailers.

Event Rate for Metered Lots
Consider scheduling event rates in metered lots that have pay stations for high impact event days and weeks; such as, National Cherry Festival, Film Festival, Ironman, Street Sale, etc. Many times during these event times visitor are cited for parking past the posted time limits. Providing the option to pay for up to 10 hours in metered lots would allow those who want to stay past the posted limit to do so at an incremental rate that will deter all day parking.

Metered Beach Lots
This would be our first implementation of a Parking Benefit District. Consideration for adding pay stations to beach parking lots; such as, Bryant Park and West End Beach for the summer

season. The revenue captured would benefit Parks & Recreation for additional maintenance expenses caused by increased usage and equipment/amenity replacement.

Bay Street Parking
This is an area that has been discussed at Traffic Committee and may benefit as a seasonal metered district as it is heavily used in the summer months. This area could be serviced by multi-space pay stations utilizing pay-by-plate.

Parking is not permitted between the hours of 3 AM-6 AM on residential streets. During the National Cherry Festival, the fine amount is $100 for the first offense, and each subsequent offense increases by $25 for violations issued on Bay Street. The fines being issued are to individuals who are parking overnight and those parking motorhomes prior to 6 AM in an attempt to secure a spot for the day. Some of these fines were contested this past summer. A suggestion was made to consider revising the ordinance to allow interested parties to purchase permits or pay via a meter to utilize these spaces overnight and all day during high demand periods.

PARKING SERVICES BAGGED METER POLICY

Effective Policy Date: June 26, 2015

Purpose

The bagging of meters to reserve on-street or off-street parking spaces allows business owners, downtown residents or professional contractors to facilitate construction, conduct promotions or events, and offer valet parking.

Definition

A "meter bag" is defined as a colored hood that fits over the top of either a single or double meter housing unit. A secure fastening device is attached that prevents persons from easily removing the device after placement. One side of the hood will have the words "NO PARKING" or "TOW AWAY ZONE" printed on it for easy identification by the public. In addition, a clear plastic window in the center of the bag houses an index card that offers information regarding the bagged meter(s); for instance, the requestor, start date and end date

General Guidelines

1) All requests for bagged meters are subject to approval by the Traverse City Parking Services (TCPS) Administrator.
2) Meter bagging requests related to work impacting the City of Traverse City Right-of-Way will require a Right-of-Way permit from the City of Traverse City Engineering Department.
3) Meter bagging requests related to events impacting the City of Traverse City will require a High Impact Event permit from the City Clerk's Office.
4) Vehicles, trailers and equipment may not be left unattended on a City street, City parking lot or parking lot leased by the City overnight without prior City of Traverse City Engineering or Clerk's Office approval.
5) A request for meter bagging should be made by a merchant, a building owner, resident or a representative of a professional organization.
6) Chapter 480 Parking Generally: 480.03 Parking on Public Property (a) Parking Prohibited…no person shall park or place a vehicle, boat or any other object in any City parking lot for the principal purpose of displaying such vehicle, boat or object for sale, for storage or for advertising purposes.
7) Long-term construction projects will address parking in the terms and conditions of the Right-of-Way permit. Terms and conditions should be discussed prior to the issuance of the permit.

Meter Bag Requests

1) Requests should be made through TCPS at least two days prior to the start date.
2) Requests made less than two days from request start are subject to approval or denial due to availability.

3) Requests exceeding five consecutive days must be authorized by the TCPS Administrator.

4) Requests that exceed four spaces must be authorized by the TCPS Administrator. All other meter bag requests can be approved by TCPS personnel.

5) Meter bagging requests that may affect a downtown merchant(s) daily business operations, may require prior written approval from the merchant(s) for APS Administrator review and approval.

6) Changes to meter bagging requests may be made by TCPS without notification to person(s) who have made the request.

7) Long-term construction projects that require close parking for employees are encouraged to purchase of monthly, quarterly or annual permits within designated permit lots rather than meter bag requests.

Required Information at Time of Request

1) Billable Entity

2) Billing Address

3) Contractor (if applicable)

4) Contact Name (billable entity and contactor)

5) Location of Request (include meter numbers if available)

6) Requested Number of Spaces (a single meter housing is equal to one space and a double meter housing is equal to two spaces)

7) Request Start and Request End Dates

8) Right-of-Way Permit Number (PROW # if applicable)

Special Circumstances

A special circumstance encompasses events, projects, or promotions that have had TCPS Administrator approval for bagged meters without incurring any charges. Special circumstances include:

1) City of Traverse City, Grand Traverse County, Downtown Traverse City Association or Downtown Development Authority events for the public.

2) Construction projects performed by subcontractors of the City or County with approval from City of Traverse City or Grand Traverse County officials.

3) All special circumstances require TCPS Administrator notification and approval.

Billing Process

1) The price for a bagged meter (per parking space per day of use); includes, Sundays and City of Traverse City designated holidays, even though, meters are not enforced during this time per the Codified Ordinances of Traverse City Chapter 484.04 'Parking Meters' section (a).

   a) Cost per meter is $12.00 for requests by a valid Right-of-Way or High Impact Event permit.

   b) Cost per meter is $15.00 for requests by a non-ROW and non-High Impact Event permit holder.

2) Billing is prepared the first week of the prior month's end and sent to the City Treasurer's office. The City Treasurer's office will issue all invoices and process payments with revenues designated to the TCPS General Ledger Account for Parking Fees – Coin # 585 – 000 – 652.00.

3) Non-contractor and Low Impact event requests are ineligible for invoicing and require prepayment prior to the fulfillment of the request.

Questions or Billing Disputes

1) Any bagged meter space that is occupied by a vehicle that is not authorized per the request is subject to citation and possible tow.
   a) Parking Services should be notified (231) 922-0241 of these occurrences.
   b) When vehicles are cited or towed at the request of the billable entity and are later identified as authorized vehicles, all expenses remain the responsibility of the billable entity.
   c) Parking in a space that is not bagged may be permitted to the requestor after contacting Parking Services, and providing the license plate of the vehicle.
2) Parking Services will address any billing questions or disputes.

Nicole VanNess
Parking Director

Jean Derenzy
DDA CEO