

Parking Subcommittee (Zoom) Meeting

Thursday, February 4, 2021
11:00 a.m.

The Parking Subcommittee
will not be held at the
Governmental Center.

The Parking Subcommittee
Meeting will be conducted
remotely via Zoom webinar
Quick Highlights for Viewing
and Participating
(Finer Details Below)

Anyone wishing to give public
comment will need to call in
and wait in a "virtual waiting
room" where their
microphones will be muted
until they are called upon:

Dial: 312-626-6799

Meeting ID: 864 1280 4631

Participant ID: # (yes just #)

Posted and Published:

The DDA recognizes the importance of not bringing people together unnecessarily in an effort to stop the spread of COVID-19. The Governmental Center has been closed to walk-in traffic and will be closed for Parking Subcommittee meetings for the foreseeable future. Members of the Subcommittee will not be present in the Governmental Center for official Subcommittee meetings.

The DDA has determined that all subcommittee meetings may be conducted remotely to assist in stopping the spread of COVID-19. Individuals with disabilities may participate in the meeting by calling-in to the number as though they were going to be giving public comments as outlined below or by calling the TDD#. Individual members of the subcommittee may be contacted via email through presiding staff member Nicole VanNess, nicole@downtowntc.com.

For members of the subcommittee and key staff, their name will appear on screen when they are speaking. For individuals who may wish to give public comment, the method for providing public comment during these remote-participation meetings is to call: 312-626-6799 and enter the Meeting and Participant ID.



Callers wishing to give public comment may call in before the meeting starts and wait in a "virtual waiting room." Going forward, these instructions will be included in every published agenda of the Parking Subcommittee. Those calling in will be able to hear the audio of the Parking Subcommittee meeting, yet their microphone will be muted.

When the Subcommittee accepts public comment, in the order calls were received, the meeting facilitator will identify the caller by the last four digits of their telephone number and ask them if they would like to make a comment.

The DDA CEO has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the DDA Office.

The City of Traverse City and Downtown Development Authority are committed to a dialog that is constructive, respectful and civil. We ask that all individuals interacting verbally or in writing with board members honor these values.

Downtown Development Authority:
c/o Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
(231) 922-0241
Web: www.downtowntc.com
303 East State Street
Traverse City, MI 49684

Welcome to the Parking Subcommittee meeting!

Agenda

	Page
1. CALL TO ORDER	
2. ROLL CALL	
3. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES	
A. Consideration of approving the minutes of the January 7, 2021 meeting (approval recommended) Parking Subcommittee - 07 Jan 2021 - Minutes - Pdf	5 - 7
4. TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT	
A. Revised TDM 3 Year Plan Transportation Demand Management Revised 3 Year Plan - Memo TDM 3 Year Plan Revised 01-2021 - PDF TDM 3 Year Revisions - PDF	9 - 15
B. Progressive Pricing Structure and Ease Time Limits Progressive Pricing and Ease Time Limits - Memo	17
C. Define Performance Targets - Permit Waitlist Surface Performance Targets - Permit Waitlist - Memo	19
5. NEW BUSINESS	
A. Smart Parking Meter Credit Card Surcharge Smart Parking Meter Credit Card Surcharge - Memo	21 - 22
6. RECEIVE AND FILE	
A. Revised Managed Parking Systems Approach Managed Approach Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline - PDF	23 - 26
7. PUBLIC COMMENT	
8. ADJOURNMENT	



**Minutes of the
Parking Subcommittee for the Downtown Development Authority
Regular Meeting
Thursday, January 7, 2021**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order over Zoom Meeting in Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Commissioner Rick Brown, Board Secretary Stephen Constantin, Board Member T. Michael Jackson, Committee Member Todd Knaus, and Board Member Richard Lewis

The following Members were absent: Board Treasurer Scott Hardy and Commissioner Debbie Hershey

Vice-chairperson Brown presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 11:04 AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

- (1) Consideration of approving the minutes of the December 3, 2020 meeting.
Approval of the minutes of the October 1, 2020 meeting.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Stephen Constantin

Yes: Rick Brown, Stephen Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, and Richard Lewis

Absent: Scott Hardy, Debbie Hershey, and Todd Knaus

CARRIED. 4-0-3 on a recorded vote

(d) **OLD BUSINESS**

- (1) Smart Parking Meter Purchase

Knaus arrived at the meeting at 11:20 AM.

Committee Discussion:

- Brown provided an overview of the Evaluation Committee's proposal review.
- Lewis would recommend amending the motion to a not-to-exceed amount.

Amended motion: The Parking Subcommittee recommends to the DDA Board entering into a contract with CivicSmart for the purchase phase 1 meters in an amount not to exceed \$175,000.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Stephen Constantin

Yes: Rick Brown, Stephen Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, and Richard Lewis

Absent: Scott Hardy, Debbie Hershey, and Todd Knaus

CARRIED. 4-0-3 on a recorded vote

(2) Updates

Commission Discussion:

- Jackson would like to see if there is an opportunity with the airport to contract parking.

(e) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

(1) The Post and Courier Article - January 1, 2021

(f) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

(g) **ADJOURNMENT**

(1) Motion to adjourn the meeting
The meeting was adjourned at 11:29 AM.

Moved by T. Michael Jackson, Seconded by Stephen Constantin

Yes: Rick Brown, Stephen Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, Todd Knaus, and Richard Lewis

Absent: Scott Hardy and Debbie Hershey

CARRIED. 5-0-2 on a recorded vote

Rick Brown, Vice-chairperson

Draft



Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Parking Director
Re: January 25, 2021
Date: Transportation Demand Management – 3 Year Plan

The Transportation Demand Management Plan is typically updated annually in October. The timing this year overlapped with the Managed Parking Systems Approach. I have updated the plan to reflect completed items and the revised focus for year 1 through October 2021.

Committee Review of Revised Transportation Demand Management (TDM) 3 Year Plan

- ✓ Goal: Promote better land use and increase development in the DDA District by reducing our need to build parking.
- ✓ Year 1: Decrease parking demand by a minimal percent.
- ✓ Year 2: Redistribute demand from highly constrained areas to underutilized areas.
- ✓ Year 3: Evaluate and adjust

Completed Items

Implementing Performance Based Pricing: The greatest accomplishment this year was the implementation of a Managed Parking Systems Approach. This approach provides flexibility to implement best practices based on systemwide utilization or process modifications based on system availability.

Parking Rates: In conjunction with the Managed Parking Systems Approach, the City Commission approved of the Parking Ceiling Rate Schedule. This schedule will provide the opportunity to plan and implement rate increases across all parking areas with the approval of the DDA Board.

Parking Communications: The addition of Community Development Director, Katy McCain, has been beneficial for Parking. She has been diligent getting up to speed and ensuring we remain consistent regular communications of parking changes.

Revised 3 Year Plan

Loading Zones: Currently, a loading zone is loading zone. In reviewing this item, we will establish defined times when the space is used for loading activities and when it can be used for parking. This will create a more efficient use of the spaces. The addition of smart meters in these spaces will help to communicate paid vs non-paid times to the parker.

Bike Share Programs: These programs go hand-in-hand with our park once initiative. When individuals are downtown and they park, we want them to stay parked. Providing bike or scooter share programs give parkers a means to get between meetings and run errands without using their vehicle.

Residential Parking - Overnight: We will continue to evaluate the residential subtopics presented earlier this year. Overnight parking continues to come up from the public and has been requested to be reviewed from the City Commission.

Ongoing Items

Destination Downtown Program: March 1, 2020, we renewed our agreement with Bay Area Transportation Authority to continue the Destination Downtown Program. The program allows participating downtown businesses in the district to designate a coordinator to manage their employee's bus cards. Currently, the ridership is the lowest which is as expected due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The program has one dedicated user each week with up to three additional infrequent riders who have collectively accounted for 149 trips. This year's usage has declined to 12% compared to last year. A second component included our commitment to contribute funds to the Bayline route which provides fare-free rides for all commuters between Meijer and Woodland Creek. The Parking Fund has not been billed for the Bayline route as BATA has temporarily suspended contributions due to the pandemic.

We plan to continue with this agreement, and will allocate Auto Parking Funds for Destination Downtown and the Bayline in our upcoming budget planning. I will be working with our Community Development Director to increase marketing and communication efforts to promote this solution to employers and employees within the DDA District. It may take time for individuals to feel comfortable utilizing public transit, and we do not want to deter anyone from having access to transportation at this time. This program offering is an important component in our managed parking system. For this reason, the DDA Board approved our request to waive DD Participation Fees for 21-22 at their January meeting.

Gather Occupancy Count Data: We continue to gather occupancy counts with the License Plate Recognition (LPR) Software, but data capture has been low due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The LPR software is heavily dependent of staff time to capture the data. We are looking forward to the installation of the on-street sensors in the 100 & 200 blocks of E Front as the sensors will report utilization 24 hours a day regardless of meter payment. This information will assist with our evaluation of adjusting meter activation times and understanding the traffic of downtown after business hours.

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Parking Subcommittee accepts and recommends moving forward with the revised Transportation Demand Management 3 Year Plan.

Transportation Demand Management 3 Year Implementation Plan
Revised January 2021



TDM Implementation

The overall goal of Transportation Demand Management (TDM) is to use multi-modal strategies to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of our available resources, and build on new opportunities/new approaches for parking.

Goal: Promote better land use and increase development in the DDA District by reducing our need to build parking.

- Improve space utilization with effective management for the 18-hour day rather than the traditional 8 AM- 5 PM workday.
- Redistribute demand using utilization reports and performance-based management with regular monitoring and adjusting.
- Expand multi-modal amenities: bike shelters, commuter benefit options, and car and bike shares opportunities.
- Encourage park-once zoning by promoting shared parking.

Year 1 Objectives:

Decrease parking demand by a minimal percent.

Revise Loading Zone Restrictions

There are many parking spaces marked as loading zones scattered throughout downtown. Some of the loading zones were added for specific business activities but have never been reviewed. We are inventorying the spaces and the restricted time limits. The enforcing loading zone time will be adjusted to relate to more appropriate loading zones times which will free up underutilized spaces.

Year 2 Objectives:

Redistribute demand from highly constrained areas to underutilized areas.

Evaluate Occupancy Data to Adjust Meter Activation Times

Data collected in years 1 and 2 will be used to determine if the posted meter times should be reduced or increased, and if seasonality should be considered. Certain locations may have little to no demand and benefit from extending the meter start time later into the morning, while other locations may benefit by having the meter end time extended later into the evening to encourage turnover of constrained blocks for those accessing downtown after the typical workday.

Year 3 Objectives:

Evaluate and Adjust

Evaluate Occupancy Count Data for Residential Permits

Occupancy will be reviewed to see if high demand of residential parking use on the periphery of downtown has decreased due to the implementation of The Downtowner, Shared-use, and Public Valet. Occupancy will be reviewed throughout other neighborhoods to determine if metered districts should be considered and if other programs are impacting residents. Once more information is available, the residential permit program will be revised to reflect the needs of both resident and non-residential needs.

Continued Efforts:

Evaluate and Adjust Metered Zones Based on Demand

Information captured in year 1 will be the basis to redistribute demand based on pricing. Areas where occupancy data has shown low utilization will have reduced meter rates, whereas, areas that show high utilization will have increased rates. The time limits in underutilized areas may be increased to allow for additional long-term parking. The overall goal is to shift the demand to underutilized areas and redistributing the demand for highly desired areas.

Evaluate and Adjust Performance Based Pricing Based on Occupancy Data

In year three, we will build off of the performance-based pricing implemented in year 2. We will modify rates to further redistribute demand from constrained areas as shown in occupancy data. This approach will be the basis for annually increasing and decreasing rates on a regular basis each subsequent year. Our biggest challenge will be effectively communicating the changes each year.

Support the Destination Downtown Program and Bayline Route

The Destination Downtown is a commuter benefit for employees within the DDA District where parking is currently constrained. This program will allow employees to access downtown by utilizing the existing City Loop and Village Loop bus routes offered by the Bay Area Transportation Authority. By providing this service, we are using funds that would be used to build parking to reduce demand, offer a parking alternative, and increase employee satisfaction. Support of the Bayline route benefits residents, employees and visitors of the region by offering a fare-free transportation alternative which includes various stops in the downtown area.

Increase Bike Parking Maintenance

Many of the inverted Us are faded and/or rusting at the base. We are inventorying and assigning a replacement scale value. Overtime, we will repair those that carry a low value, and fully replace the existing Us with a high value. In a full replacement, the color scheme will change which will help make bike parking options more identifiable. Included in the maintenance program, we are exploring fix-it station options and expanded seasonal in-street rack locations. We will continue to seek our locations where bike shelters can be installed and more inverted Us added.

Increase Communications and Provide Counseling Services

As we plan to make regular adjustments, we are evaluating how we can effectively communicate these changes to our day-to-day parkers (employees and residents) and our visitors. We continue actively updating the interactive map but will seek out other media forms that appeal to all users of the parking system. We remain the point of contact for all parkers new to the system and would like to engage more with employers on employee orientations along with providing easy to follow parking guides for new hire packets.

Support Eliminating Redundant Curb Cuts

We will continue to support new projects eliminating curb cuts as outlined in the local ordinance, as well as, encouraging existing property owners to utilize alley access and free up curbside spaces. These efforts will further promote the walkability of downtown.

Partner with Private Property Owners to Add 3 New Lots for Permit and Evening Parking Shared-use

There are many private parking lots that are primarily used for traditional workday employee parking. By

partnering with the private property owners, we can offer additional permit and evening parking to increase efficient use of the lots while redistributing demand for those visiting downtown in the evening hours and on weekends.

Gather Occupancy Counts

Up until last year, we did not have true occupancy counts which leaves the utilization throughout the parking system open to perception. Over the past year, we have been collecting data manually through physical counts. Most recently our request for a counting program was approved. Once the License Plate Recognition (LPR) cameras and software is installed this summer, we will collect and report on actual occupancy. We intend to collect data for a year while we define a performance-based management approach to further redistribute demand. During this time, we will review new meter technologies that allow for easy reconfiguration and potentially adding credit cards on-street.

Parking Partnerships

Redevelop existing surface lots, either as mixed-use buildings with public parking or as parking-structures with street-level commercial uses, in line with the redevelopment vision for the downtown core. Facilitate joint-development partnerships to bring targeted land-uses to the downtown. Discourage on-site, private parking at new downtown development projects, by offering reliable access to shared, TCPS-managed parking structures.

Transportation Demand Management 3 Year Implementation Plan
Revised ~~October 2019~~ January 2021

Year 1 – October 2020-September 2021

- ~~• Parking Rates~~
- Loading Zones
- Bike Share Programs
- Residential – Overnight Parking

Year 2 – October 2021-September 2022

- ~~• Develop zones based on demand~~
- Implement Performance Based Pricing
- ~~• Evaluate Data for Residential Permits~~
- Evaluate data to adjust meter activation times (evening, seasonal, late morning)
- Publish 5 Year Rate Increase Schedule

Year 3 – October 2022-September 2023

- ~~• Evaluate and Adjust Performance Based Pricing~~
- ~~Evaluate data to Adjust Meter Activation Times (evening, seasonal, late morning)~~ Evaluate data for Residential Permits

Ongoing

- Increase Bike Parking Maintenance (Inverted Us, in-street racks, permanent shelters, fix-it stations)
- Increase Communications and Provide Counseling Services
- Support eliminating redundant curb-cuts
- Add New Private Lots for Permit and Evening Parking Shared-use which may include Pay-by-phone
- Gather Occupancy Count Data
- Evaluate and adjust metered zones based on demand
- Evaluate and adjust Performance Based Pricing
- Support the Destination Downtown Program and Bayline Route



Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
Date: January 25, 2021
Re: Establish Progressive Rate Structure (Ease Time Limits)

The 100 and 200 blocks of East Front currently have a time limit of 3 hours. In previous meetings we have discussed various ways to allow customers to extend past the posted limit without being penalized yet enforce the spaces to reduce abuse and ensure turnover. Finding a solution for this request has always been problematic due to old technology and lack of programmability.

The smart parking meter and sensor installation will allow the occupancy of the space to be tracked for each transaction. With communication between the two devices, we are able to program the meters to charge a regular rate and an increased hourly rate for overtime hours. This flexibility of easing time limits improves the downtown parking experience by:

1. Charging regular rates for the maximum area time limit
2. Incentivize turnover by increasing hourly rates for overtime parking
3. Provide parkers the ability to determine their desired time
4. Reduce enforcement of non-paid expired meters

	Rate	Total
1 hour	\$1.25	\$1.25
2 hours	\$1.25	\$2.50
3 hours	\$1.25	\$3.75
4 hours	\$1.75	\$5.50
5 hours	\$2.00	\$7.50
6 hours	\$2.50	\$10.00
7 hours	\$2.50	\$12.50
8 hours	\$2.50	\$15.00
9 hours	\$2.50	\$17.50
10 hours	\$2.50	\$20.00

RECOMMENDATION: The Parking Subcommittee recommend the DDA Board of Director's establish a progressive rate structure for meters with no time limits.



Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
Date: January 25, 2021
Re: Define Performance Targets – Permit Waitlist Surface

The parking permit program started as a way to provide employees with a reduced cost for parking in the downtown area. Over the recent years, parking permits have been purchased by residents, for long-term storage, and even visitors. Until Managed Parking Systems Approach was adopted this summer, there was no limit to the number of permits that were sold, and permit locations were expanded into metered areas to accommodate capacity issues. Following the approval of the Managed Parking Systems Approach changes were made system-wide in order to follow policies that would us to gather utilization data. These changes included: (1) decoupling surface lots from garage permits, and (2) removing overflow permit locations.

As of January 29, 2021, our first waitlist will be implemented for surface parking permits. Garage permits will be sold until surface spaces become available. Over the next couple of months, we will monitor utilization based on the 5% oversell ratio (surface permit to surface spaces). Data captured will be used to define our performance-based targets for surface permits as recommended in the Transportation Demand Management final report which include: (1) Define performance-based targets, (2) Define thresholds for management change, (3) Vary rates by season, and (4) Expand employee-parking options via daytime RPP permits.

A recommendation will be brought back to the Parking Subcommittee when additional information is available.



Memorandum

To: Parking Subcommittee
 From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
 Date: January 25, 2021
 Re: Smart Parking Meter Credit Card Surcharge

The smart parking meter installation will result in additional credit card processing. I have been reviewing historical credit card information in order to provide an estimate of the additional credit card fees we can anticipate incurring once the new meters are installed. We will not know the actual credit card use until the meters are installed and use data is captured, and we should expect credit card expenses to increase year-over-year as parkers transition from coin to credit.

Credit card processing fees are comprised of hourly parking transactions for the Old Town Parking Garage and Hardy Parking Garage; hourly parking transactions from 29 multi-space pay stations; online transactions for citations and permits; and in-office for all parking transactions. We do not pay any credit card fees on Parkmobile transactions. Parkmobile app users pay a per transaction convenience fee for this service, and Parkmobile retains this fee in lieu of a contract fee. Recent credit cards fees:

2018/19 \$94,573.33

2019/20 \$81,557.06

*2020/21 \$43,950.48

*Through November 30, 2020

Credit card usage has continued to increase year-over-year. 2019-20 was on target to have increased usage prior to the pandemic, but did not increase due to reduced transactions from between March and June. The information below compared to coin collections supports the increase of users transitioning from coin/cash payments to credit card use.

	2015-16*	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20**
Parkmobile	57,320	77,876	134,979	208,682	198,130
Digital IRIS	12,042	148,526	180,144	197,823	178,058
Total	69,362	226,402	315,123	406,505	376,188

*Pay station quantity increased from 13 to 26

**Pay station quantity increased from 26 to 29

In order provide an estimate on new credit card processing fees, I used historical credit card capture information. The new meters will be installed in the premium zone where they are likely to see regular use due to store front proximity. A single meter could have up to 5 transactions a day during the 313 enforceable days per year. An estimate of 17,400 credit card transactions per month was used. This is based on each meter processing between 2-3 transactions per day.

On Monday, February 2, 2021, the City Commission will consider the request to move forward with Hartland as a credit card processor. Hartland has identified the low per transaction tickets that are processed in the parking industry, and worked with Visa and MasterCard directly to negotiate reduced interchange rates. These rates are as low as Visa at 1.5% + \$0.05 per transaction (reduced from 5% + \$0.22) and MasterCard at 2% + \$0.02 per transaction (reduced from 5% + \$0.22). I have used their estimate to calculate credit card processing fees of \$0.23-\$0.25 per transaction. This calculation is based on a \$2.00 transaction of which \$0.06-\$0.08 interchange fee and \$0.17 vendor/merchant service bank fee. The estimate of 17,400 transactions a month would result in processing fees of \$48,024 per year. Total credit card expenses can be complicated as there are bank fees, gateway fees, interchange fees and more. The actual credit card processing fees may be more or less than the projected estimate.

The CivicSmart meters are capable of charging a surcharge fee for credit card payments. Charging a small surcharge fee will help to reduce the credit card processing expenses. Those paying cash would not be subject to the surcharge fee. The minimum charge for a credit card is 1 hour or \$1.25 in the premium zone.

	Rate	Visa (Rate x 1.5% + \$0.05 + \$0.17)	MasterCard (Rate x 2% + \$0.02 + \$0.17)
1 hour	\$1.25	\$0.24	\$0.22
2 hours	\$2.50	\$0.26	\$0.24
3 hours	\$3.75	\$0.28	\$0.27

RECOMMENDATION: The Parking Subcommittee recommend the DDA Board of Director’s establish a smart parking meter credit card surcharge of \$0.22 per transaction.

Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline

Version 5

Last Updated: January 25, 2021

Timelines are based on the following approval:

- There are no current items pending approval

Timeline for implementation in 2021:

- May 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Increase (Seasonal Increase)
- November 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Decrease (Seasonal Decrease)

May 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Increase (Seasonal Increase) TENTATIVE

This is the planned date for a rate increase based on current information. Both meter and hourly parking garage rates would increase to the maximum premium or maximum peak rates approved for 2021. These rates are subject to change based on availability and usage of the overall parking system.

November 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Decrease (Seasonal Decrease) TENTATIVE

This is the planned date for a rate decrease based on current information. Both meter and hourly parking garage rates would decrease back to the January 1, 2021 rates. These rates are subject to change based on availability and usage of the overall parking system.

Rate and Policy Change History

Timeline for implementation in 2021:

- January 1, 2021 – Rate Increases

January 1, 2021 - Rate Increases

Reference Attachment C: 2021 Rate Increases

Rate increases for meters, parking garages, permits, specified parking violations and event parking are effective January 1, 2021. For meters, the rates will be based on zones.

Timeline for implementation in 2020:

- October 5, 2020 – City Commission Introduction of ordinance change
 - Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles
 - Rescind Same Day Meter Violation Discount
- October 19, 2020 – City Commission Enactment of ordinance change
 - Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles
 - Rescind Same day meter violation discount
- November 2, 2020 – Policy Changes (Phase 1)
 - Permits by Location (Surface or Garage)
 - Remove Permit Overflow Lots/Streets
 - Handicap Placards Require MISOS Issued Free Parking Sticker
- November 16, 2020 - City Commission Introduction of ordinance change
 - Past Limit on Sign
 - No Permit/Failure to Display
- December 1, 2020 – Same Day Meter Discount No Longer Issued
- December 7, 2020 – City Commission Enactment of ordinance change
 - Past Limit on Sign
 - No Permit/Failure to Display

October 5, 2020 – City Commission approval of Rate Maximums

Rate Maximum table is adopted. (Reference Attachment B: Proposed Rate Maximums)

October 5, 2020 – Introduction of ordinance change – Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles

Current ordinance – 484.04(a) has an exception that fully electric vehicles are not required to activate parking meters.

Rescinded ordinance - Rescind the exception that fully-electric vehicles do not need to activate the parking meter which would eliminate free parking for fully electric cars in chapter 484.04(a)

Purpose of ordinance change – The amendment to the ordinance was made in May of 2007 as a way to promote electric vehicles as they were fairly new at the time. Each space that we operate have a value and associated costs to operate. There are many more electric vehicles now than existed in 2007, and there should be a cost to park for each space regardless of who is using it.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have been parking for free at meters.

October 5, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change - Rescind same day meter violation discount

Current ordinance – Provides a same day discount of ½ (\$5) the meter violation amount (\$10) when paid in person or online and prior to escalation.

Rescinded ordinance - Rescind the same day discount.

Purpose of ordinance change – The rates will gradually increase to determine the base and premium amounts; the parking violations will not be adjusted until there is additional information available.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have taken advantage of the discount.

October 19, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles

October 19, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Rescind same day meter violation discount

November 2, 2020 – Permits by location (Surface or Garage) and Remove Overflow Permit Locations Lots and Streets Policy Change

Current policy – Garage permit holders are able to use their garage permits to park in surface parking lots.

New policy - Effective November 1, 2020 permits will be required to park in the location of their purchase. Those who purchased a surface permit will be required to park in surface and those who purchased a garage permit will be required to park in either of the two parking garages. All overflow locations would be reduced to move permit parkers back into designated permit locations.

Purpose of policy change – This is a process that has been followed since the first parking garage was built and garage permits were made available for sale. Allowing individuals to park in the surface lots with a garage permit reduces the number of available spaces for surface permit holders. When this occurs, we increase surface permit lot spaces by allowing permits at meters which reduces metered parking. In order to understand utilization and occupancy of permits sold, we need to ensure permits are being used by location.

Challenges – We will need to create a waitlist and add a waitlist policy. By requiring permit holders to park in their designated locations, we may see occupancy increase and no longer be able to sell permits for surface, garage or both. Additionally, garage capacity may be filled by permits only and not allow for transient use. When this occurs, we will need to determine the permit sale threshold if we would like to offer transient parking.

November 2, 2020 – Handicap Placard Policy Change

Current policy – Anyone displaying a state issued handicap placard does not have to pay the meter, but must abide by the posted time limit.

New policy - Effective November 3, 2020 those displaying a handicap placard will be required to activate the meter with the exception of those issued a state free parking sticker.

Purpose of policy change – This policy has been in effect for an unknown amount of time. A revised approach was implemented in May of 2015 to limit placard use to the posted time limits. Each space that we operate have a value and associated costs to operate, and there should be a cost to park for each space regardless of who is using it. The State of Michigan does offer an application process for free parking, and we should adhere to state guidelines.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have been parking for free at meters.

November 16, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change – Past Limit on Sign

Current ordinance – Base amount is \$10, 1st escalation \$10 (\$20 balance), and 2nd escalation \$10 (\$30 balance).

Amend ordinance – Increase fine schedule: Base amount \$15, 1st escalation \$15 (\$30 balance), and 2nd escalation \$15 (\$45 balance).

Purpose of ordinance change – The rate in time parking locations; such as, neighborhoods would increase. The goal would be that those seeking free parking alternatives or avoiding rate increases at the meters would not move to all day parking in residential areas as the violation amount is more than the meter violation amount.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who receive citations for parking past the posted limit.

November 16, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change – No Permit/Failure to Display

Current ordinance – Base amount is \$10, 1st escalation \$10 (\$20 balance), and 2nd escalation \$10 (\$30 balance).

Amend ordinance – Increase fine schedule: Base amount \$15, 1st escalation \$15 (\$30 balance), and 2nd escalation \$15 (\$45 balance).

Purpose of ordinance change – The rate in permit lots would increase. The goal would be that those seeking free parking alternatives or avoiding rate increases at the meters would not move to permit lots and reduce the amount of available permit parking spaces as the violation amount is more than the meter violation amount.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who receive citations for parking in permit areas without a permit.

December 7, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Past Limit on Sign

December 7, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – No Permit/Failure to Display