

## **Parking Subcommittee (Zoom)**

Thursday, January 7, 2021  
**11:00 a.m.**

The Parking Subcommittee  
will not be held at the  
Governmental Center.

The Parking Subcommittee  
Meeting will be conducted  
remotely via Zoom webinar  
Quick Highlights for Viewing  
and Participating  
(Finer Details Below)

Anyone wishing to give public  
comment will need to call in  
and wait in a "virtual waiting  
room" where their  
microphones will be muted  
until they are called upon:

**Dial: 312-626-6799**

**Meeting ID: 892 2381 8687**

**Participant ID: # (yes just #)**

Posted and Published:



The DDA recognizes the importance of not bringing people together unnecessarily in an effort to stop the spread of COVID-19. The Governmental Center has been closed to walk-in traffic and will be closed for Parking Subcommittee meetings for the foreseeable future. Members of the Subcommittee will not be present in the Governmental Center for official Subcommittee meetings.

The DDA has determined that all subcommittee meetings may be conducted remotely to assist in stopping the spread of COVID-19. Individuals with disabilities may participate in the meeting by calling-in to the number as though they were going to be giving public comments as outlined below or by calling the TDD#. Individual members of the subcommittee may be contacted via email through presiding staff member Nicole VanNess, [nicole@downtowntc.com](mailto:nicole@downtowntc.com).

For members of the subcommittee and key staff, their name will appear on screen when they are speaking. For individuals who may wish to give public comment, the method for providing public comment during these remote-participation meetings is to call: 312-626-6799 and enter the Meeting and Participant ID.

Callers wishing to give public comment may call in before the meeting starts and wait in a "virtual waiting room." Going forward, these instructions will be included in every published agenda of the Parking Subcommittee. Those calling in will be able to hear the audio of the Parking Subcommittee meeting, yet their microphone will be muted.

When the Subcommittee accepts public comment, in the order calls were received, the meeting facilitator will identify the caller by the last four digits of their telephone number and ask them if they would like to make a comment.

The DDA CEO has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the DDA Office.

The City of Traverse City and Downtown Development Authority are committed to a dialog that is constructive, respectful and civil. We ask that all individuals interacting verbally or in writing with board members honor these values.

Downtown Development Authority:  
c/o Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
(231) 922-0241  
Web: [www.parking.downtowntc.com](http://www.parking.downtowntc.com)  
303 East State Street  
Traverse City, MI 49684

---

## Welcome to the Parking Subcommittee meeting!

# Agenda

	Page
<b>1. CALL TO ORDER</b>	
<b>2. ROLL CALL</b>	
<b>3. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES</b>	
A. Consideration of approving the minutes of the December 3, 2020 meeting (approval recommended). <a href="#">Parking Subcommittee - 03 Dec 2020 - Minutes - Pdf</a>	5 - 6
<b>4. OLD BUSINESS</b>	
A. Smart Parking Meter Purchase <a href="#">Smart Parking Meter Purchase - Memo</a> <a href="#">Smart Meter Vendor Cost Comparison - PDF</a> <a href="#">Parking Rates by Zone Downtown - PDF</a>	7 - 11
B. Updates <a href="#">Parking Updates - Memo</a> <a href="#">Parking Changes Mailer January 2021 - PDF</a>	13 - 16
<b>5. RECEIVE AND FILE</b>	
A. The Post and Courier Article - January 1, 2021 <a href="#">TPAC Parking Garage Part of Tech Office Deal</a>	17 - 19
<b>6. PUBLIC COMMENT</b>	
<b>7. ADJOURNMENT</b>	





**Minutes of the  
Parking Subcommittee for the Downtown Development Authority  
Regular Meeting  
Thursday, December 3, 2020**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the 2nd Floor Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Board Treasurer Scott Hardy, Commissioner Rick Brown, Commissioner Debbie Hershey, Board Secretary Stephen Constantin, Board Member T. Michael Jackson, Committee Member Todd Knaus, and Board Member Richard Lewis

The following Members were absent: None

Chairperson Hardy presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 11:01 AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

- (1) Approval of the minutes of the October 1, 2020 meeting.  
Consideration of approving the minutes of the October 1, 2020 meeting.

Moved by Debbie Hershey, Seconded by T. Michael Jackson

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Rick Brown, Debbie Hershey, Stephen Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, Todd Knaus, and Richard Lewis

**Absent:** None

**CARRIED. 7-0-0 on a recorded vote**

(d) **OLD BUSINESS**

- (1) Rate Increases for 2021

(e) **NEW BUSINESS**

(1) Smart Parking Meter RFP

Discussion from Subcommittee:

- Hardy provided an overview to the subcommittee of his initial review: level of technology, pay stations vs single space, equipment to fit existing infrastructure. The need to find a balance for all users.
- Knaus would prefer a single use device especially during a pandemic so not everyone is touching the same screen also some will find multi-space on-street aggravating to wait 10 minutes.
- Jackson commented with visitors, single space is much more convenient. Would like to see characteristics of how long in the space and use a case based approach.
- Hardy inquired about information on when office workers would return to downtown.
- Jackson asked that we look into the airport contract since they are moving to an authority.

(f) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

(1) The Post and Courier Article - November 28, 2020

(g) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

(h) **ADJOURNMENT**

(1) The meeting was adjourned at 11:42 AM.  
Motion to adjourn the meeting.

Moved by T. Michael Jackson, Seconded by Debbie Hershey

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Rick Brown, Debbie Hershey, Stephen Constantin, T. Michael Jackson, Todd Knaus, and Richard Lewis

**Absent:** None

**CARRIED. 7-0-0 on a recorded vote**

---

Scott Hardy, Chairperson



## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Subcommittee  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: January 5, 2021  
Re: Smart Parking Meter Purchase

Last month, we reviewed the advantages and disadvantages of single space vs multi-space meters in order to provide feedback for the evaluation committee to consider when reviewing the proposals. The discussion focused on the overall customer convenience attributes offered by single space meters. Having a meter at each space eliminates any confusion for the public and visitors on where to pay; reduces the amount of walking to find a pay station; reduces lines formed when multiple parkers are attempting to pay at the same time; and provides upfront information specific to the space (hour limits, rates, etc.).

With this information, the Evaluation Committee focused on the single space vendors in order to provide a better solution for the end user. There were four vendors that submitted single space meter bids. One of the bidders was removed from consideration as their solution did not include hardware and was solely solution (application) based. The three remaining proposals were evaluated on meeting the core requirements, technological requirements, demonstrating timeline for deliverables along with other criteria for project management and implementation. Their meter mechanism hardware is similar with some having additional fees for EMV (chip-card) or near-field communication (NFC) capabilities. Their back-office software varied in complexity and capabilities of information that could be provided, but all provided the minimum requirements. Additional discussion included the vendor's supplemental proposals for multi-space meters and real-time technologies. The Evaluation Committee acknowledged the benefit of partnering with a vendor where we can expand services with multi-space or sensors in order to gain better service by having one provider.

Staff completed reference checks for the vendors and the majority of the feedback was positive. Some references shared frustration and dissatisfaction with service and hidden fees. Many of the references shared points of consideration for the implementation process. These discussions included fees related to credit card processing, and one has used historical data to determine that credit card processing is 25-30% of meter revenues.

There are 1120 single space meters actively being used in the field. The initial phase will consist of replacing 292 meters in the premium zone or core downtown streets. This zone includes the majority of storefront retail spaces which are highly valued for customer convenience. The

replacement with smart parking meters will allow for payment by credit card, the addition of smart cards (reusable value cards), and an integration with Parkmobile to display paid time on meter. The only outstanding item is the meter housing and if they can be reused or need to be retrofitted. The estimated capital purchase of this replacement is \$106,284 with annual fees of \$19,272 for software and communications.

Additionally, there is an added value section that includes pricing for sensors. The sensors provide usage data that can reflect real-time occupancy, including real-time usage in the Parkmobile application. This information would allow for automated reporting and greatly reduce staff time to capture occupancy counts and compile for reporting. Sensors also communicate directly with the meter mechanism to prevent overtime parking and zero out transactions. These features aid with space turnover. There are 78 spaces in the 100 and 200 blocks of East Front. Including the sensors at the time of the meter replacement allows us to begin capturing data on two of the most utilized blocks downtown. The estimated capital purchase of this equipment is \$17,898 with annual fees of \$3,240 for software and communications.

Credit card processing fees have been based on historical information captured by Parkmobile. We will not know the actual credit card use until the meters are installed and use data is captured. An estimate of 17,400 credit card transactions per month was used to calculate estimated credit card processing fees of \$48,000 per year.

I am working with Jean on reviewing our past revenue and preparing projections. We will provide this information at our meeting.

**RECOMMENDATION: The Parking Subcommittee recommends the approval of the expenditure of Auto Parking Funds for the purchase of smart parking meters, sensors and recurring software and communication fees with final costs to be provided to the DDA Board.**



		Civic Smart		IPS		POM	
Quantity	Description	Per Meter Cost	Total	Per Meter	Total	Per Meter	Total
<b>Capital Costs</b>							
292	Single Space Smart Meter	\$ 275.00	\$ 80,300.00	\$ 540.00	\$ 157,680.00	\$ 740.00	\$ 216,080.00
292	Field Installation	\$ 25.00	\$ 7,300.00	\$ 21.00	\$ 6,132.00	\$ -	\$ -
292	Estimated Freight*	\$ 27.00	\$ 7,884.00	\$ 17.50	\$ 5,110.00	\$ -	\$ -
1	Training	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
10	Recommended spare parts*	\$ 780.00	\$ 7,800.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 1,608.00	\$ 16,080.00
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Capital Subtotal</b>	\$	<b>106,284.00</b>	\$	<b>176,922.00</b>	\$	<b>232,160.00</b>
<b>Monthly Costs</b>							
292	Wireless Communications, Software Fees, Device Fees	\$ 5.50	\$ 1,606.00	\$ 6.25	\$ 1,825.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 1,460.00
17400	Credit Card Gateway Fees (Vendor)*	\$ 0.06	\$ 1,044.00	\$ 0.13	\$ 2,262.00	\$ 0.08	\$ 1,392.00
17400	Credit Card Fees (Merchant Services billed separate by Bank)*	\$ 0.17	\$ 2,958.00	\$ 0.22	\$ 3,828.00	\$ 0.22	\$ 3,828.00
1	Integration Fees	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 800.00	\$ 800.00	\$ -	\$ -
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Monthly Subtotal (+Estimate*)</b>	\$	<b>5,608.00</b>	\$	<b>8,715.00</b>	\$	<b>6,680.00</b>
<b>Warranty Costs</b>							
292	Extended Warranty Fees	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 42.50	\$ 12,410.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 14,600.00
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Warranty Subtotal</b>	\$	<b>-</b>	\$	<b>12,410.00</b>	\$	<b>14,600.00</b>
<b>Additional Costs</b>							
292	Housing Replacement	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 235.00	\$ 68,620.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 58,400.00
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Additional Expense Subtotal</b>	\$	<b>-</b>	\$	<b>68,620.00</b>	\$	<b>58,400.00</b>
	<b>Meter Replacement Total (Capital + Additional)</b>	\$	<b>106,284.00</b>	\$	<b>245,542.00</b>	\$	<b>290,560.00</b>
	<b>Meter Replacement Annual Total (Monthly + Warranty)</b>	\$	<b>67,296.00</b>	\$	<b>116,990.00</b>	\$	<b>94,760.00</b>
<b>Value Added Capital</b>							
78	Sensors	\$ 125.00	\$ 9,750.00	\$ 295.00	\$ 23,010.00	\$ -	\$ -
6	Gateway Devices*	\$ 400.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
78	Sensor Installation	\$ 39.00	\$ 3,042.00	\$ 21.00	\$ 1,638.00	\$ -	\$ -
6	Gateway Installation	\$ 100.00	\$ 600.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
78	Estimated Frieght*	\$ 27.00	\$ 2,106.00	\$ 17.50	\$ 1,365.00	\$ -	\$ -
	Training	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Value Added Capital Subtotal</b>	\$	<b>17,898.00</b>	\$	<b>26,013.00</b>	\$	<b>-</b>
<b>Value Added Monthly Costs</b>							
78	Wireless Communications, Software Fees, Device Fees	\$ 3.00	\$ 234.00	\$ 6.50	\$ 507.00	\$ -	\$ -
6	Gateway Fees*	\$ 6.00	\$ 36.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	<b>Value Added Monthly Subtotal (+Estimate)</b>	\$	<b>270.00</b>	\$	<b>6,084.00</b>	\$	<b>-</b>
	<b>Value Added Capital Total</b>	\$	<b>17,898.00</b>	\$	<b>26,013.00</b>	\$	<b>-</b>
	<b>Value Added Annual Total (Monthly)</b>	\$	<b>3,240.00</b>	\$	<b>73,008.00</b>	\$	<b>-</b>
		\$		\$		\$	
	<b>Meter + Sensor Purchase</b>	\$	<b>124,182.00</b>	\$	<b>271,555.00</b>	\$	<b>290,560.00</b>
	<b>Meter + Sensor Annual Fees (Vendor)</b>	\$	<b>22,512.00</b>	\$	<b>27,984.00</b>	\$	<b>17,520.00</b>
	<b>Annual Credit Card Fees (Payment Processor + Bank)</b>	\$	<b>48,024.00</b>	\$	<b>73,080.00</b>	\$	<b>62,640.00</b>









## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Subcommittee  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: January 5, 2021  
Re: Updates

### **2021 Parking Rate Increases**

Staff worked diligently to reprogram 1120 single space meters in two days. Programming was used to increase the rates in the parking lots at the pay stations, the parking garages and through the mobile application. As a reminder, the peak-hour rate was not implemented at the parking garages. The next rate increase is planned for May 1, 2021, but will depend on utilization

### **Parking Communications Plan**

Our Community Development Director, Katy McCain, sent a postcard to all City residents overviewing the January, 1, 2021 changes that included: metered parking rate increases and rate zones; handicap placard free parking sticker; transit opportunities; and elimination of the meter violation discount.

### **2021 Meeting Schedule**

The following are the 2021 dates for the Parking Subcommittee Meetings. We will continue to meet via Zoom until it is safe to return to in-person meetings. All meetings are planned for the 1<sup>st</sup> Thursday of the month at 11:00 AM.

January 7 <sup>th</sup>	February 4 <sup>th</sup>	March 4 <sup>th</sup>	April 1 <sup>st</sup>	May 6 <sup>th</sup>	June 3 <sup>rd</sup>
July 1 <sup>st</sup>	August 5 <sup>th</sup>	September 2 <sup>nd</sup>	October 7 <sup>th</sup>	November 4 <sup>th</sup>	December 2 <sup>nd</sup>



# IMPORTANT REMINDER FOR 2021 DOWNTOWN PARKING CHANGES

Please visit [parking.downtowntc.com](http://parking.downtowntc.com) for more information.





## THESE PARKING CHANGES GO INTO EFFECT JANUARY 1, 2021

- **Rate increases and changes (metered parking)**
- **New rate zones (Zones 1 & 2)**  
Rate maps available at [parking.downtowntc.com](http://parking.downtowntc.com)
- **Introduction of wait list for parking deck**
- **Affordable alternatives**
  - The Bayline
  - Destination Downtown
  - Surface Lots
- **Proper handicap stickers are needed**  
Visit [michigan.gov](http://michigan.gov) to learn more
- **No longer offering same day discount for parking tickets**

For all up-to-date parking information  
please visit [parking.downtowntc.com](http://parking.downtowntc.com)



The Post and Courier eEdition | Friday, January 1, 2021

# Parking garage part of tech office deal

## City's purchase is \$26.9 million

BY MARY KATHERINE WILDEMAN  
[mkwildeman@postandcourier.com](mailto:mkwildeman@postandcourier.com)



PROVIDED/THOMAS & HUTTON

The Charleston Tech Center (right) is nearing completion on Morrison Drive in Charleston. The city bought the adjacent parking garage (left) under an agreement with the developers.

The City of Charleston has purchased a new parking garage along the quickly developing Morrison Drive corridor as part of a deal to establish a business hub that would attract technology employers to the property.

The project is set to come to fruition early this year with the opening of the six-story Charleston Tech Center.

The city is leasing the upper peninsula property to the Charleston Digital Corridor for \$1 a year. Under the terms of the deal, the nonprofit would see to it that a tech-focused office building with parking was constructed on part of the two-acre site.

The investment for the entire project is about \$54 million, according to the developer, Charleston-based private equity firm Iron Bridge Capital Partners.

The city recently bought the 816-space garage for about \$26.9 million, according to an announcement.

"Today, we're proud to see another puzzle piece of our vision to build an economically resilient community come to fruition," said Ernest Andrade, the Charleston Digital Corridor's director.

Construction began on the project in July 2019. It's finishing up on schedule and on budget despite COVID-19 lockdowns and an economic downturn brought about by the coronavirus pandemic, according to the developer.

The deal has been in the works for about seven years. The Charleston Digital Corridor first outlined the project in 2013, and the city bought the property at Morrison Drive and Conroy Street for \$1.8 million later that year, according to public land records. Officials initially hoped it would be open by the summer of 2016.

The garage sale was one of the terms of the 2019 development agreement.

Matthew Frohlich, the city's deputy chief finance officer, said 15 percent of the parking spots will be for transient use, with some spaces set aside for the nearby Meeting Street Academy. He said it's hard to predict how much revenue it will generate, but no parking will be offered for free or at a discount.

Andrade said rates for employees who work at the Charleston Tech Center and use the garage will be the same as the city charges elsewhere, roughly \$125 per month for weekdays.

About 70 percent of the space available in the adjacent office building was leased as of early December. The Charleston Digital Corridor and Iron Bridge will be among the tenants, as will some tech firms based outside of Charleston but with

local operations. They include software companies PlanSource, an Orlando, Fla., company that focuses on human resources, and Workiva, a business-data firm from Iowa that helps large companies with their reporting and compliance requirements.

Local tenants include Conrex Property Management, which has developed a software platform to connect renters with affordable homes, and Atlatl, a which helps customers create three-dimensional visualizations of their products and will be relocating from upper King Street. Atlatl CEO Justin Scott said in a statement that the new headquarters location was a good fit for the firm's workplace culture and could help it attract new employees.

"We share the same vision with the Charleston Tech Center of creating talent density in one area so that employees benefit not only from an amazing office but from the vibrant tech community in the building," he said. The building's amenities include a napping room, a podcast studio, conference space and outdoor table tennis. The bottom floor is set aside for retail and restaurant uses. The developers also installed an upgraded lighting and filtered ventilation system designed to help keep the building COVID-19 free.

Plans call for a second office building to be developed on the Morrison Drive property. Spaces in the newly opened garage will be set aside for that project once it's completed.

Reach **Mary Katherine Wildeman** at 843-607-4312. Follow her on Twitter

@mkwildeman.