



## **Parking Advisory Board**

Wednesday, October  
5, 2022

**11:00 a.m.**

2nd Floor Committee,  
Governmental Center  
400 Boardman Avenue  
Traverse City,  
Michigan 49684



The City of Traverse City does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission to, access to, treatment in, or employment in, its programs or activities. Penny Hill, Assistant City Manager, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan 49684, phone 231-922-4440, TDD/TTY 231-922-4412, VRS 231-421-7008, has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the ADA Coordinator.

If you are planning to attend and you have a disability requiring any special assistance at the meeting and/or if you have any concerns, please immediately notify the ADA Coordinator.

The City of Traverse City and Downtown Development Authority are committed to a dialog that is constructive, respectful and civil. We ask that all individuals interacting verbally or in writing with board members honor these values.

Downtown Development Authority:  
c/o Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
(231) 922-0241  
Web: [www.parking.downtowntc.com](http://www.parking.downtowntc.com)  
303 East State Street  
Traverse City, MI 49684

---

## Welcome to the Parking Advisory Board meeting

# Agenda

	Page
<b>1. CALL TO ORDER</b>	
<b>2. ROLL CALL</b>	
<b>3. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES</b>	
A. Consideration of approving the minutes of the September 7, 2022 meeting. <a href="#">Parking Advisory Board - 07 Sep 2022 - Minutes - Pdf</a>	5 - 6
<b>4. OLD BUSINESS</b>	
A. Regional Downtown Survey <a href="#">Regional Downtown Survey - Memo</a>	7
B. Employee Survey <a href="#">Downtown Employee Parking Survey - Memo</a>	9 - 10
<b>5. NEW BUSINESS</b>	
A. Old Town Garage Permit Fee <a href="#">Old Town Garage Permit Fee - Memo</a> <a href="#">Managed Approach Attach A Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline</a>	11 - 17
<b>6. TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT</b>	
A. Revised TDM Report Update <a href="#">Revised TDM Report Update - Memo</a>	19
<b>7. RECEIVE AND FILE</b>	
A. Updates <a href="#">Parking Services Updates - Memo</a>	21 - 22
<b>8. PUBLIC COMMENT</b>	
<b>9. ADJOURNMENT</b>	



# CITY COMMISSION

## GOALS & OBJECTIVES

### 2022-2023

---



#### **HOUSING & HOMELESSNESS**

Increase opportunities for more diverse housing through public and private options.



#### **ACCESS & MOBILITY**

Invest in multi-modal mobility strategies and existing and future infrastructure so that individuals of all ages, abilities and income have a network of complete, barrier free, safe, year round access to our community's amenities and basic needs.



#### **CONNECTING PEOPLE WITH EACH OTHER AND NATURE**

Invest in facilities and amenities in order to create vibrant City spaces that connect all people to nature and to each other.



#### **ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

The City will foster economic development by adopting a growth mentality and by conserving and maintaining natural resources. It will work with partners to invest in and maintain amenities that support a wide variety of industries, build the workforce, and attract well-paying jobs with the region's future in mind.



#### **WATER SYSTEMS**

Proactively and consistently maintain, conserve, and manage water and water systems to reduce harm to the systems themselves as well as public health and safety.



#### **CLIMATE CHANGE**

Address climate within all of our City priorities, goals, policies, and actions.





**Minutes of the  
Parking Advisory Board for the Downtown Development Authority  
Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, September 7, 2022**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the 2nd Floor Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Board Vice Chair Scott Hardy, Committee Member Todd Knaus, Commissioner Doug Hickman, Board Member Pam Marsh, and Board Member Katy Bertodatto

The following Members were absent: None

Chairperson Hardy presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Hardy called the meeting to order at 11:01 AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

- (1) Approval of the minutes of the July 6, 2022 advisory board meeting  
That the Parking Advisory Board approve the minutes as presented.

Moved by Doug Hickman, Seconded by Todd Knaus

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Todd Knaus, Doug Hickman, and Katy Bertodatto

**Absent:** Pam Marsh

**CARRIED. 4-0-1 on a recorded vote**

(d) **TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT**

- (1) TDM Presentation

Marsh joined the meeting at 11:06 AM

The following addressed the Board:  
Thomas Brown, Nelson/Nygaard  
Bradley Strader, MKSK

(e) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

- (1) Updates and Information 2022

The following addressed the Board:  
Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director

(f) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment

(g) **ADJOURNMENT**

- (1) Motion to adjourn the meeting  
The meeting was adjourned at 12:26 PM

Moved by Todd Knaus, Seconded by Doug Hickman

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Todd Knaus, Doug Hickman, Pam Marsh, and Katy Bertodatto

**Absent:** None

**CARRIED. 5-0-0 on a recorded vote**

---

Scott Hardy, Chairperson



## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
CC: Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO  
Date: October 3, 2022  
Re: Regional Downtown Survey

Downtown has changed over the past two and a half years. There have been many contributing factors including the pandemic, bridge construction, and soon the repaving of Grandview Parkway. We know there are less office employees, retail and restaurant hours have been reduced, and employee retention has declined. Identifying the shift in downtown patronage is a bigger issue than parking.

We will continue the discussion on a regional survey at the meeting.







## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: September 23, 2022  
Re: Downtown Employee Parking Survey

Following the TDM draft revision presentation from Nelson/Nygaard, the Parking Advisory Board suggested surveying employees on parking and mobility in the downtown district. The survey would identify where employees are parking, if employers are providing mobility incentives, and if reduced costs would encourage behavior changes.

In parking, we often refer to our parking problem as a walking problem. We have worked with our consultant Thomas Brown of Nelson/Nygaard modify the employee survey to capture recent data related to employee parking and mobility. The survey is ready to be published and would be available online. In order to encourage employees to take part in the survey and to achieve our desired behavior change, the Board asked for consideration of offering free Old Town parking permits.

- 1) The survey will be offered to all employees within the DDA District.
- 2) The first 50 employees who participant will be offered permit paid for by the DDA.
- 3) Employees will be required to complete a survey in order to obtain a free one-month parking permit for the Old Town Garage.
- 4) Employees will be asked to complete a follow-up survey at the expiration of the permit.

The Auto Parking Fund is an enterprise fund with the purpose of being self-sustaining. Due to declined use in the area, the Old Town Fund expenses have exceeded the revenues the past two fiscal years. These expenses are covered by the Parking General Fund. There is a separate agenda item to recommend reducing the permit rates knowing that the expenses are likely to exceed the revenues, and the recommendation is to ask the DDA Board to cover the cost of permits using TIF Funds in order to provide the free permits.

This item will go before the DDA Board at their October 21, 2022 meeting. In anticipation of their approval, the survey would be available November 1, 2022 and would continue until all permits are issued.

**Recommendation: The Parking Advisory Board recommends the DDA Board approve an expenditure up to \$2,800 to purchase parking permits for employees who complete the downtown employee survey.**



## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: September 23, 2022  
Re: Old Town Garage Permit

A Managed Parking Systems Approach (MPSA) provides for the flexibility to implement change through performance pricing based on the ebbs and flows of a dynamic system. Rates increase or decrease at incremental levels based on utilization. These changes do not have definitive timeframes, and regularly evolve and change.

Over the past year, we have monitored the occupancy levels at Old Town Garage. We have seen an increase in transient use likely due to short-term rentals in the area, and the permit use remains low. Presentations by Planning Urban Management Agency (PUMA), Traverse Connect and other entities have indicated that employers will continue to offer a hybrid work environment reducing their needs for office space for the foreseeable future. With high office vacancy rates, we will continue to see available parking in both parking structures.

Reducing permit cost is an incentive to change parking and walking habits by encouraging the use of the less convenient spaces for all day parking in order to better utilize short-term high demand parking spaces more efficiently for all economic activities that are serviced in the downtown district. This can be achieved decreasing permit rates at the Old Town Parking Garage to encourage use of underutilized spaces.

The planned termination of Lot P (100 W State) will reduce surface permit spaces by 55, leaving a total of 243 permit spaces available between Lot T (corner Union/Grandview Parkway) and Lot V (corner W Front/Pine). The employees that park in surface lots are typically parking for a duration of 4 or more hours. We have already notified surface permit parkers that we will offer alternative parking at the Old Town Garage for the duration of the active permit.

In order to encourage the continuation of this change and a behavior shift, we are proposing a new permit option. An Old Town permit will only be allowed at the Old Town Parking Garage and the cost of \$30 per month is less than a surface permit.

- \$30 per month is equal to 24 hours of metered parking at \$1.25 per hour
- 4 hours of metered parking 5 days a week is equal to \$25
- 6 hours of metered parking 5 days a week is equal to \$37.50
- 8 hours of metered parking 5 days a week is equal to \$50
- \$30 per month is less than 2 overnight stays (\$40) at the daily rate for the parking garage

Type	Area	Price	Change
Old Town (NEW)	Old Town Garage	\$30.00	\$30.00
Hardy	Hardy and Old Town Garage	\$50.00	No change
Surface	Lot T, Lot V, Temporary Old Town Garage	\$38.00	No change

The City Commission approved the Managed Parking Systems Approach (MPSA) in 2020. The proposed recommendation is within the guidelines of the MPSA, and will not need City Commission approval. This item will go to the DDA Board at their October 21, 2022 meeting. If approved at their meeting, we can make this new permit available November 1, 2022. These dates are reflected in the revised Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline Attachment A.

**Recommendation: The Parking Advisory Board recommend the DDA Board approve the permit parking changes and rates as proposed.**

## Attachment A: Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline

Version 7

Last Updated: September 23, 2022

Timelines are based on the following approval:

- DDA Board - October 21, 2022 – Permits by location (Separate Garages)

Timeline for implementation in 2022:

- **November 1, 2022**

**November 1, 2022 – Permits by location (Separate Garages) and Remove Hardy from Old Town -**

Current policy – Garage permit holders are able to use their garage permits to park in both Hardy and Old Town parking garages.

New policy - Effective November 1, 2022 Garage permits will be separated into two options 1) Old Town – access to Old Town, and 2) Hardy – access to Hardy and Old Town.

Purpose of policy change – Garage permits have been sold with access to both structures at the same rate since Old Town opened. We have tracked utilization since the pandemic. Utilization levels are low which supports principles of demand-based pricing. Decoupling Hardy from the Old Town permit and creating a new Old Town permit at a cheaper rate will provide more cost-effective options for parkers and may shift demand to this underutilized area. Directing demand to this area aids in modifying behavior and engaging the walkability in the downtown district.

Challenges – We may hear from parkers who are dissatisfied with this new offer if they have purchased Old Town permits at a higher rate, and the structure is now offered at a lower rate. We may continue to experience a reluctance to walk from this location due to proximity and accessibility during inclement weather months.

## Rate and Policy Change History

### Timeline for implementation in 2021:

- November 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Decrease (Seasonal Decrease)
- May 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Increase (Seasonal Increase)
- January 1, 2021 – Rate Increases

### November 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Decrease (Seasonal Decrease)

This is the planned date for a rate decrease based on current information. Both meter and hourly parking garage rates would decrease back to the January 1, 2021 rates. These rates are subject to change based on availability and usage of the overall parking system.

### May 1, 2021 – Meter and Garage Rate Increase (Seasonal Increase)

This is the planned date for a rate increase based on current information. Both meter and hourly parking garage rates would increase to the maximum premium or maximum peak rates approved for 2021. These rates are subject to change based on availability and usage of the overall parking system.

### January 1, 2021 - Rate Increases

Reference 2021 Rate Increases

Rate increases for meters, parking garages, permits, specified parking violations and event parking are effective January 1, 2021. For meters, the rates will be based on zones.

### Timeline for implementation in 2020:

- October 5, 2020 – City Commission Introduction of ordinance change
  - Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles
  - Rescind Same Day Meter Violation Discount
- October 19, 2020 – City Commission Enactment of ordinance change
  - Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles
  - Rescind Same day meter violation discount
- November 2, 2020 – Policy Changes (Phase 1)
  - Permits by Location (Surface or Garage)
  - Remove Permit Overflow Lots/Streets
  - Handicap Placards Require MISOS Issued Free Parking Sticker
- November 16, 2020 - City Commission Introduction of ordinance change
  - Past Limit on Sign
  - No Permit/Failure to Display
- December 1, 2020 – Same Day Meter Discount No Longer Issued
- December 7, 2020 – City Commission Enactment of ordinance change
  - Past Limit on Sign
  - No Permit/Failure to Display

### October 5, 2020 – City Commission approval of Rate Maximums

Rate Maximum table is adopted. (Reference Attachment B: Proposed Rate Maximums)

Managed Approach Attach A Parking Rate and Policy Changes Timeline v7.docx

**October 5, 2020 – Introduction of ordinance change – Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles**

Current ordinance – 484.04(a) has an exception that fully electric vehicles are not required to activate parking meters.

Rescinded ordinance - Rescind the exception that fully-electric vehicles do not need to activate the parking meter which would eliminate free parking for fully electric cars in chapter 484.04(a)

Purpose of ordinance change – The amendment to the ordinance was made in May of 2007 as a way to promote electric vehicles as they were fairly new at the time. Each space that we operate have a value and associated costs to operate. There are many more electric vehicles now than existed in 2007, and there should be a cost to park for each space regardless of who is using it.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have been parking for free at meters.

**October 5, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change - Rescind same day meter violation discount**

Current ordinance – Provides a same day discount of ½ (\$5) the meter violation amount (\$10) when paid in person or online and prior to escalation.

Rescinded ordinance - Rescind the same day discount.

Purpose of ordinance change – The rates will gradually increase to determine the base and premium amounts; the parking violations will not be adjusted until there is additional information available.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have taken advantage of the discount.

**October 19, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Rescind Free Parking for Electric Vehicles**

**October 19, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Rescind same day meter violation discount**

**November 2, 2020 – Permits by location (Surface or Garage) and Remove Overflow Permit Locations Lots and Streets Policy Change**

Current policy – Garage permit holders are able to use their garage permits to park in surface parking lots.

New policy - Effective November 1, 2020 permits will be required to park in the location of their purchase. Those who purchased a surface permit will be required to park in surface and those who purchased a garage permit will be required to park in either of the two parking garages. All overflow locations would be reduced to move permit parkers back into designated permit locations.

Purpose of policy change – This is a process that has been followed since the first parking garage was built and garage permits were made available for sale. Allowing individuals to park in the surface lots with a garage permit reduces the number of available spaces for surface permit holders. When this occurs, we increase surface permit lot spaces by allowing permits at meters which reduces metered parking. In order to understand utilization and occupancy of permits sold, we need to ensure permits are being used by location.

Challenges – We will need to create a waitlist and add a waitlist policy. By requiring permit holders to park in their designated locations, we may see occupancy increase and no longer be able to sell permits

for surface, garage or both. Additionally, garage capacity may be filled by permits only and not allow for transient use. When this occurs, we will need to determine the permit sale threshold if we would like to offer transient parking.

**November 2, 2020 – Handicap Placard Policy Change**

Current policy – Anyone displaying a state issued handicap placard does not have to pay the meter, but must abide by the posted time limit.

New policy - Effective November 3, 2020 those displaying a handicap placard will be required to activate the meter with the exception of those issued a state free parking sticker.

Purpose of policy change – This policy has been in effect for an unknown amount of time. A revised approach was implemented in May of 2015 to limit placard use to the posted time limits. Each space that we operate have a value and associated costs to operate, and there should be a cost to park for each space regardless of who is using it. The State of Michigan does offer an application process for free parking, and we should adhere to state guidelines.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who have been parking for free at meters.

**November 16, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change – Past Limit on Sign**

Current ordinance – Base amount is \$10, 1<sup>st</sup> escalation \$10 (\$20 balance), and 2<sup>nd</sup> escalation \$10 (\$30 balance).

Amend ordinance – Increase fine schedule: Base amount \$15, 1<sup>st</sup> escalation \$15 (\$30 balance), and 2<sup>nd</sup> escalation \$15 (\$45 balance).

Purpose of ordinance change – The rate in time parking locations; such as, neighborhoods would increase. The goal would be that those seeking free parking alternatives or avoiding rate increases at the meters would not move to all day parking in residential areas as the violation amount is more than the meter violation amount.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who receive citations for parking past the posted limit.

**November 16, 2020 - Introduction of ordinance change – No Permit/Failure to Display**

Current ordinance – Base amount is \$10, 1<sup>st</sup> escalation \$10 (\$20 balance), and 2<sup>nd</sup> escalation \$10 (\$30 balance).

Amend ordinance – Increase fine schedule: Base amount \$15, 1<sup>st</sup> escalation \$15 (\$30 balance), and 2<sup>nd</sup> escalation \$15 (\$45 balance).

Purpose of ordinance change – The rate in permit lots would increase. The goal would be that those seeking free parking alternatives or avoiding rate increases at the meters would not move to permit lots and reduce the amount of available permit parking spaces as the violation amount is more than the meter violation amount.

Challenges – Dissatisfaction of those who receive citations for parking in permit areas without a permit.

**December 7, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – Past Limit on Sign**



**December 7, 2020 – Enactment of ordinance change – No Permit/Failure to Display**





## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: September 30, 2022  
Re: Revised TDM Presentation Update

The revised Transportation Demand Management Study will be presented to the City Commission at their November 14, 2022 study session. Thomas Brown of Nelson/Nygaard is currently working on incorporating feedback into the final report. I would like to collect any comments or thoughts from the presentation last month in order to pass them on.

We anticipate the DDA Board and City Commission to adopt the final report by the end of the year. Once the report is adopted, we will move forward with formulating a new 3 year workplan.





## Memorandum

---

To: Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: September 30, 2022  
Re: Updates and Information

### **Parking Advisory Board Openings**

We will advertise in the October Newsletter that we are seeking two volunteers for the Parking Advisory Board to review strategies, advise, and provide recommendations. The primary purpose of the Advisory Board is to establish a Work Plan based on Transportation Demand Management (TDM) objectives. First round applications are due no later than November 2, 2022. Applicants may apply here: <https://forms.gle/vjryFjmbfyWLbX5y8>.

### **Lot P Lease Termination**

Parking Lot P (located at 128 W State Street) is a privately owned lot that the city has leased for permit parking for several years. Recently, the DDA received notice from the property owner that the lease for this lot will be terminated. The east portion of the lot containing 2 rows and 24 spaces will close October 3, 2022, and the west portion containing 3 rows and remaining 32 spaces will close October 31, 2022. On November 1, 2022, all public parking signs indicating parking by surface permit will be removed.

There is adequate parking for permit holders within the parking system. The following locations are available for permit parking:

1. Surface permits will retain access to both City owned surface permit parking lots:
  - a. Lot T - 100 East Grandview Parkway corner of N Union/Grandview Parkway
  - b. Lot V - 100 W Front corner of W Front/Pine
2. All surface permit holders will be offered a free proximity card to park at the Old Town Parking Garage for the remaining duration of their surface parking permit effective time.
3. All surface permit holders may upgrade their permit to park at the Hardy Parking Garage for the remaining duration of time, and proximity card fees will be waived.

### **Permit Waitlist**

We anticipate that we will reach full capacity of surface parking lots T and V once lot P is closed. At that time, we will no longer allow for surface permits to be purchased. All surface permit parkers who would like to retain access to their surface permits, must renew their permits on or before their expiration date to remain permit eligible. A courtesy reminder permit renewal

notification is sent via email two weeks prior to expiration. Failure to renew will result in the parker forfeiting their right to renew their permit. All new surface permit requests will be placed on the waitlist. The view or download the waitlist policy and guidelines please visit our website:

<https://parking.downtowntc.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2021/01/Waitlist-Policy-2021.pdf>

**Seasonal Meter Rate Decrease**

A meter rate decrease for fall 2022 has been scheduled with our vendors and will take effect in October. The seasonal rate decrease will consist of the Premium Zone decreasing from \$1.50 per hour to \$1.25 per hour and the Non-premium Zone remaining at \$1.25 per hour. Both parking garages will remain at an hourly rate of \$1.25 and \$1.50 per hour with a \$20.00 daily maximum. The off-seasonal rate will continue through April 30, 2023.