



Parking Advisory Board

Thursday, February 3,
2022

11:00 a.m.

2nd Floor Committee,
Governmental Center
400 Boardman Avenue
Traverse City,
Michigan 49684



The City of Traverse City does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission to, access to, treatment in, or employment in, its programs or activities. Penny Hill, Assistant City Manager, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan 49684, phone 231-922-4440, TDD/TTY 231-922-4412, VRS 231-421-7008, has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the ADA Coordinator.

If you are planning to attend and you have a disability requiring any special assistance at the meeting and/or if you have any concerns, please immediately notify the ADA Coordinator.

The City of Traverse City and Downtown Development Authority are committed to a dialog that is constructive, respectful and civil. We ask that all individuals interacting verbally or in writing with board members honor these values.

Downtown Development Authority:
c/o Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
(231) 922-0241
Web: www.parking.downtowntc.com
303 East State Street
Traverse City, MI 49684

Welcome to the Parking Advisory Board meeting

Agenda

| | Page |
|--|------------|
| 1. CALL TO ORDER | |
| 2. ROLL CALL | |
| 3. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES | |
| A. Consideration of approving the minutes of the October 7, 2021 meeting (approval recommended) Parking Subcommittee - 07 Oct 2021 - Minutes - PDF | 3 - 5 |
| B. Consideration of approving the minutes of the December 2, 2021 meeting (approval recommended) Parking Subcommittee - 02 Dec 2021 - Minutes - Pdf | 7 - 8 |
| 4. NEW BUSINESS | |
| A. Parking Policy and Ordinance Changes: Non-transferable permit clause, short-money collection and virtual tire chalking Permit Policy and Ordinance Change - Memo | 9 - 10 |
| 5. RECEIVE AND FILE | |
| A. Parking Updates Parking Services Update - Memo | 11 - 12 |
| 6. PUBLIC COMMENT | |
| 7. ADJOURNMENT | |



**Minutes of the
Parking Subcommittee for the Downtown Development Authority
Regular Meeting
Thursday, October 7, 2021**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the 2nd Floor Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Board Vice Chair Scott Hardy, Board Member T. Michael Jackson, Commissioner Doug Hickman, Board Member Pam Marsh, and Michelle Jones

The following Members were absent: Committee Member Todd Knaus and Board Secretary Richard Lewis

Chairperson Hardy presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Hardy called the meeting to order at 11:03 AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

- (1) Consideration of approving the minutes of the Parking Subcommittee meeting of August 12, 2021 (Approval Recommended)

Approval of the minutes of the Parking Subcommittee meeting of August 5, 2021.

Motion to approve the minutes of the August 12, 2021 Parking Subcommittee Meeting as presented.

Moved by T. Michael Jackson, Seconded by Pam Marsh

Yes: Scott Hardy, T. Michael Jackson, Doug Hickman, Pam Marsh, and Michelle Jones

Absent: Todd Knaus and Richard Lewis

CARRIED. 5-0-2 on a recorded vote

(d) **SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS**

- (1) Introduction and Nomination

(e) **OLD BUSINESS**

- (1) Employee Parking

The following addressed the Subcommittee:

Scott Hardy
Pam Marsh
T Michael Jackson
Doug Hickman
Michelle Jones

(f) **TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT**

- (1) 3 Year Plan

The following addressed the Subcommittee:

Scott Hardy
T Michael Jackson
Doug Hickman

(g) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

- (1) Waitlist - Surface Permits
(2) East Front Street Feedback

(h) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

The following addressed the Subcommittee:

T Michael Jackson

(i) **ADJOURNMENT**

- (1) Motion to adjourn the meeting.

Scott Hardy, Chairperson

Draft



**Minutes of the
Parking Subcommittee for the Downtown Development Authority
Regular Meeting
Thursday, December 2, 2021**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the 2nd Floor Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Board Vice Chair Scott Hardy, Committee Member Todd Knaus, and Commissioner Doug Hickman

The following Members were absent: Board Member Pam Marsh and Michelle Jones

Chairperson Hardy presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Hardy called the meeting to order at 11:02 AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

No quorum. Meeting continued for discussion only.

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

(1) Removed

(d) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

(1) Approval of the approval of the October 7, 2021 meeting minutes.

(e) **NEW BUSINESS**

(1) Permit Policy Change: Implement a non-transferable clause (Discussion Only)

The following address the Subcommittee:
Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Scott Hardy
Todd Knaus
Doug Hickman

(f) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

(1) Establish After-hours Permit Rate (DDA Board Approved 11/19/2021)

(g) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

(h) **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Hardy ended the meeting at 11:38 AM.

Scott Hardy, Chairperson



Memorandum

To: Parking Advisory Board
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
Date: January 27, 2022
Re: Parking Policy and Ordinance Changes: Non-transferable clause, Short-money collection, and virtual tire chalking

The increase of infill development downtown has included residential units that are not occupied by full-time year-round residents, but rather have been purchased for the purposes of short-term rentals. Over the past year, there has been an increase in parking permits purchased by owners or management companies for the use by rental guests. There has also been an increase in long-term storage at the bike racks and multiple bike locker rentals. The person purchasing the permit does not always identify that the permit will be for nonpersonal use, but the use case is typically identified when the renter has issues entering or exiting the parking garage.

The increased amount of improper use by rental guests has ebbs and flows that are typically higher between Thursday-Mondays. The misuse is most commonly the result of tenants pulling tickets and refusing to pay or attempts to enter or exit with multiple vehicles with one permit. Conversations in the lane have been difficult for staff as their involvement is met with frustration from the guests. We are not familiar with the instructions or information that the owner provided as part of their rental agreement. There have been many conversations that resulted in comments that our customer service was poor as we have attempted to adhere to our policies.

In September, when I called other Michigan communities to gather information related to employee permits, I inquired about their policies on short-term rental parking. Most all define the use of their parking permits for the permit holder only and their non-transferable clauses were tied to revoked parking privileges for misuse.

We recently began the initial phase of the video management system (VMS) installation. The VMS will have some capabilities to view and search for license plates entering and exiting. This new ability will provide us with video evidence of misuse. This is an opportunity to change the policy and implement a nontransferable clause. Any misuse that led to revoked privileges or additional fees would be supported by video evidence. Implementing a non-transferable clause into our policy would be overarching for all permit holders. The only exception would be for shared accounts where we have companies that have floater permits, and their employees are familiar with the proper uses.

The ordinance change would make permits non-transferable and require all short-term renters to pay hourly rates or purchase their own permit. This change will allow for staff to directly communicate with the purchaser on how to use the permit.

In December, the Parking Advisory Board (Parking Subcommittee) met even though there was not a quorum in order to introduce this item and have an initial discussion. Following the meeting, a letter was sent to all known property owners and property management companies. We have had conversations with 11 owners and managers. The discussions were positive and understood why the change is being proposed. The only request is to allow for a temporary implementation period in order to accommodate bookings that have already been confirmed for the summer 2022 season.

Lastly, given that we have to go to City Commission to approve and enact the ordinance changes, we are planning to include two additional ordinances:

- 1) Allow for the collection of short-money fees at parking garages. There is not currently a way to collect money from motorists who park in the garage and are unable to pay. This change will allow for the issuance of a parking citation to the vehicle that exits as a short-money. If the short-money payment is made, the citation would be reduced. But if the short-money payment is not collected, the citation would stand and follow existing escalation, notice letter, and collection processes.
- 2) Update ordinance text to clarify virtual tire chalking. Physical tire chalking for "Past time limit" violation has been in recent court cases and appeals over the past two years. We are working on an ordinance update that would include definitions for virtual tire chalking. Specifically, the process around virtual tire chalking that uses photos and GPS coordinates of license plates and tire valve stems.

Staff has submitted a draft of this item to the City Attorney and is planning for this item to go before the DDA Board in February and the City Commission to follow with anticipation of enacting ordinance changes in late March or early April 2022

RECOMMENDATION: That the Parking Advisory Board recommend the approval of incorporating a non-transferable clause for parking permits, short-money payments for parking garages, and virtual tire chalking into the parking policies and related City ordinances.



Memorandum

To: Parking Advisory Board
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
Copy: Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Date: January 24, 2022
Re: Parking Services Update

Parking Office Reduced Hours

Effective Sunday, January 30, 2022 we are implementing reduced hours. This schedule will be evaluated near six weeks, with the anticipation that normal operations would return on Sunday, March 13th. The goal of the reduced hours is to ease scheduling with the current staff and allow staff to have time off on the weekend since we have been unsuccessful in filling positions for nearly a year.

We will staff on Sunday, February 20th for Restaurant Week as the facilities will have more use for the holiday weekend and the event.

The reduced hours schedule would look like the following:

Sunday – Closed

Monday – 7 AM-10 PM

Tuesday – 7 AM-11 PM

Wednesday - 7 AM-11 PM

Thursday – 7 AM-11 PM

Friday – 7 AM-11 PM

Saturday 8 AM-11 PM

Smart Meter Sensors

The smart meter and sensor installation occurred the last week of June 2021. Since then, we have been tracking ongoing calibration issues with the sensors. The issue is that the sensors are not reporting a true reflection or even slight variance of on-street utilization. Occupancy reports are lower than expected. On some days, 100% utilization may reflect 80% occupancy rates. To be clear, this is a sensor only issue, and has no effect on the motorists paying at the meters. By system design, the sensors are programmed to always error on the side of the motorist.

We have performed numerous remote field tests with their development team and even after backend configuration changes were made, we have still been unable to resolve the occupancy data capture issues. CivicSmart is now recommending replacing inground sensors with pole mount sensors. We are awaiting additional information from them along with a summary

explaining the issues with the inground sensors. The replacement would be at no cost to the City. However, there are concerns of potential damage to pole mount sensors especially during snow removal. We will continue to evaluate and provide an update once we make additional progress on resolving this item.

Amano-McGann

Amano-McGann has terminated a 30-year distributor partnership with Traffic & Safety Control Systems Inc. effective January 17, 2022. Amano-McGann is the manufacturer of the parking access and revenue control system (PARCS) equipment at both parking garages. Traffic & Safety will continue to support service calls and spart parts. There will come a point in time when they no longer have spare parts on the shelf and require additional support to which Amano will not support them. I have been unsuccessful in determining who future service calls should be directed to in the event that that we have an issue that Traffic & Safety cannot support.

Our equipment was replaced in the summer of 2017. The minimum lifespan of PARCS equipment is seven years. We are hopeful that T&S will be able to support the equipment until we obtain bids for replacement. This may be an opportunity to purchase a PARCS solution that offers remote cashiering and additional functionality that would offer more flexibility in facility management, and we look forward to exploring these options with the time comes.

The current unknown is whether we will have support to implement the shared accounts or after-hours permits that have been planned. Some of these features may require programming on the Amano support end and until we can connect with their support staff, we cannot offer an implementation date.

Parkmobile Guest Check-out QR Codes

Parkmobile has notified all of their customers that they are aware of scams involving QR codes for parking payments in Texas. The scams are not limited to Parkmobile only and have also been identified by other mobile payment apps that use QR codes. Scammers have replicated QR codes and adhered them over existing QR codes. When scanned the QR code takes you to a portal to pay that is not the Parkmobile site. Users that are directly impacted are those who are using the guest checkout feature. This is the feature that allows for payment without setting up an account. Users how have the Parkmobile App on their phone and use the app to initiate transactions are not affected.

While this scam has not been replicated, we have reached out to our account manager to initiate a reprint of all Parkmobile stickers. Once delivered, we will have them on-hand to replace all QR codes in the event that our site is compromised. It is recommended that users who have the Parkmobile App initiate all transactions through their app. For those using guest checkout, be attentive that the website collecting payment data has the Parkmobile logo with the look and feel of a company owned site and does not appear to be a generic site.