



**Minutes of the
Downtown Development Authority for the City of Traverse City
Regular Meeting
Friday, December 16, 2022**

A regular meeting of the Downtown Development Authority of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the Training Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 8:30 a.m.

The following Board Members were in attendance: Chairperson Gabe Schneider, Board Member Steve Nance, Board Vice Chair Scott Hardy, Board Member Damian Lockhart, Board Member Jeff Joubran, Mayor Richard Lewis, Board Member Pam Marsh, Board Member Pam DeMerle, Board Member Todd McMillen, Board Member Katy Bertodatto, and Board Member Michael Brodsky, Student Liaison Will Unger.

The following Board Members were absent: Board Member Peter Kirkwood

Chairperson Schneider presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Schneider called the meeting to order at 8:30AM.

(b) **ROLL CALL**

Michael Brodsky arrived at 8:32am.

(c) **ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

(1)

Election of Officers (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)

Meeting turned to Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO, to call for nominations for chair of the 2023 DDA Board of Directors.

Katy Bertodatto nominated Gabe Schneider as Chair.

That the DDA Board elect Gabe Schneider as Chair.

Moved by Katy Bertodatto, Seconded by Richard Lewis

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(2)

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO, turned the meeting over to Chair Schneider to complete the election of officers.

Richard Lewis nominated Scott Hardy as Vice Chair.

Richard Lewis nominated Jeff Joubran as Treasurer.

Richard Lewis nominated Richard Lewis as Secretary.

That the DDA Board elect Scott Hardy as Vice Chair, Jeff Joubran as Treasurer and Richard Lewis as Secretary.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Todd McMillen

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(d) **COMMITTEE STRUCTURE**

(1) Committee Appointments (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO

Gabe Schneider

Steve Nance

Scott Hardy

Richard Lewis

Katy Bertodatto

Pam DeMerle

Michael Brodsky

Pam Marsh

Gabe Schneider amended the 2023 meeting schedule to reflect DDA Board meetings to begin at 9am.

Discussion of Study Sessions for 2023 being the first Friday of every month beginning in February.

That the DDA Board approve the 2023 meeting schedule as amended.

Moved by Katy Bertodatto, Seconded by Scott Hardy

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

That the DDA Board of Directors appoint William (Bill) Clark of Bay Area Transportation Authority to the Parking Advisory Board.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Scott Hardy

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(e) **REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

(1) Consideration of approving the agenda as presented.

Gabe Schneider amended the agenda to include a closed session at the end of the meeting.

Approval of the agenda as amended.

Moved by Jeff Joubran, Seconded by Scott Hardy

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(f) **CONSENT CALENDAR**

The purpose of the consent calendar is to expedite business by grouping non-controversial items together to be dealt with by one DDA Board motion without discussion. Any member of the DDA Board, staff or the public may ask that any item on the consent calendar be removed therefrom and placed elsewhere on the agenda for individual consideration by the DDA Board; and such requests will be automatically

respected. If an item is not removed from the consent calendar, the action noted in parentheses on the agenda is approved by a single DDA Board action adopting the consent calendar.

- (1) Approval of the minutes of the November 18, 2022 Downtown Development Authority Board of Directors meeting (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)
- (2) Consideration of approving financial reports and disbursements for DDA, TIF 97, Old Town TIF, Parking Services and Arts Commission for November 2022 (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)
- (3) Bridge Funding (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)
- (4) Funding for data collection State St./Pine St./Boardman Ave. (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)
- (5) Memorandum of Understanding - TART/City of Traverse City (Approval Recommended) (Jean Derenzy)
- (6) Additional Permits for Old Town Parking Deck (Approval Recommended) (Nicole VanNess, Jean Derenzy)

That the DDA Board approve the consent calendar as presented.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Todd McMillen

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(g) **SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS**

- (1) Moving Downtown Forward Presentation (Approval Recommended) (Brad Segal, Jean Derenzy)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Brad Segal
Gabe Schneider
Amanda Kannard
Megan Motil
Scott Hardy
Steve Nance
Katy Bertodatto
Jeff Joubran

That the DDA Board of Directors approve the Moving Downtown Forward final report.

Moved by Katy Bertodatto, Seconded by Steve Nance

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky
Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

(h) **NEW BUSINESS**

- (1) Hardy Two-Way Traffic Conversion Project (Approval Recommended) (Nicole VanNess, Jean Derenzy)

VanNess distributed a revised memo to the Board.

The Following Addressed the Board:

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Nicole VanNess
Pam Marsh
Michael Brodsky
Richard Lewis
Katy Bertodatto
Steve Nance
Gabe Schneider

Richard Lewis recommended delaying this motion until after the closed session.

[Revised Hardy Two-Way Traffic Conversion PARCS - Memo](#)

(i) **CEO REPORT**

- (1) Project Updates (Jean Derenzy)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Jeff Joubran
Scott Hardy
Michael Brodsky

(j) **BOARD MEMBER REPORTS**

- (1) Arts Commission Update (Steve Nance)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Steve Nance
Gabe Schneider

- (2) Parking Advisory Board Update (Scott Hardy)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Scott Hardy

(k) **STAFF REPORTS**

- (1) Transportation and Mobility Director Report (Nicole VanNess)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Nicole VanNess
Gabe Schneider
Scott Hardy
Pam Marsh
Katy Bertodatto
Michael Brodsky
Richard Lewis

- (2) Communications and Outreach Director Report (Art Bukowski)

The Following Addressed the Board:

Art Bukowski
Scott Hardy
Pam Marsh
Katy Bertodatto
Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO

- (3) Downtown Experience Coordinator Report (Abby Taylor)

(l) **RECEIVE AND FILE**

- (1) DTCA November 2022 Meeting Minutes
- (2) October Parking Advisory Board Meeting Minutes
- (3) October Arts Commission Meeting Minutes
- (4) Update on State St./Pine St./Boardman Ave.

(m) **CLOSED SESSION FOR POTENTIAL PROPERTY PURCHASE MCL 15.268 (d)**
(MOTION REQUIRED)

- (1) Motion to enter into closed session.
Entered into closed session 10:02AM through Roll Call Vote.

That the DDA Board enter into closed session.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Steve Nance

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubbran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

Motion to enter back into regular session at 10:50AM.

That the DDA Board adjourn the closed session.

Moved by Jeff Joubbran, Seconded by Katy Bertodatto

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubbran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, and Katy Bertodatto

Absent: Peter Kirkwood and Michael Brodsky

CARRIED. 10-0-2 on a recorded vote

That the DDA Board of Directors recommend the City Commission execute a contract with T2 Systems, Inc. for the Hardy Parking Garage equipment and installation more-or-less of \$400,000 and for the Old Town Parking Garage for more-or-less of \$150,000 subject to approval and to its substance by the City Manager and its form by the City Attorney, and to amend the parking management software services to increase the software contract more-or-less of \$150,000 with funds available in the Auto Parking System Fund.

Moved by Richard Lewis, Seconded by Katy Bertodatto

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubbran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, and Katy Bertodatto

Absent: Peter Kirkwood and Michael Brodsky

CARRIED. 10-0-2 on a recorded vote

(n) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Following Addressed the Board:

Steve Nance

Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Pam Marsh
Jeff Joubran
Katy Bertodatto
Scott Hardy
Damian Lockhart

(o) **ADJOURNMENT**

- (1) Motion to Adjourn the meeting.
That the DDA Board of Directors adjourn the meeting at 10:59AM.

Moved by Damian Lockhart, Seconded by Pam Marsh

Yes: Gabe Schneider, Steve Nance, Scott Hardy, Damian Lockhart, Jeff Joubran, Richard Lewis, Pam Marsh, Pam DeMerle, Todd McMillen, Katy Bertodatto, and Michael Brodsky

Absent: Peter Kirkwood

CARRIED. 11-0-1 on a recorded vote

Jean Derenzy, Traverse City DDA
CEO



Memorandum

To: DDA Board of Directors
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director
CC: Jean Derenzy, DDA CEO
Date: December 12, 2022
Re: Hardy Two-way Traffic Conversion and PARCS Project

In 2020, when the DDA Board approved looking at a traffic circulation study for front and state, there was also a study to identify circulation impacts to the Hardy Parking relating to converting to two-way traffic since the ingress and egress were designed and built based on the one-way traffic patterns. WGI, Inc published the first study in February 2021. The report indicated modifications to both the entry and exit lanes due to reversed traffic patterns of oncoming traffic. The scope was updated in March of 2022 to remove Front Street and focus on State Street only. The revised impact study published by Fishbeck in March of 2022 confirmed the modifications to interior traffic patterns, operational changes and reconfiguration of lanes and equipment.

It is important to identify within this communication that equipment upgrades were identified for the Hardy Parking Garage. Upgrades to equipment are routinely scheduled in our Capital Improvement Plan for both parking garages for replacement on a seven-year basis. With all equipment, technologies need to be upgraded prior to becoming obsolete in order to keep the system operable and maintain security protocols. The largest component of the proposals has to do with the parking and revenue control systems (PARCS) software and equipment as it is most impactful to our operations.

In 2022, the DDA moved forward with plans to implement a pilot two-way traffic conversion on State Street, a request for proposals for the Hardy Two-way Traffic Conversion Project was published in September with the intent to implement the modifications identified in the Fishbeck Impact Study. The RFP was inclusive of all modifications in the report with the understanding that the equipment proposed would be capable of returning to its existing location should the pilot not be made permanent, and that one contract for all items is preferred, but proposals for individual items would be accepted.

Our current distributor no longer has a partnership with Amano McGann who has been the software and equipment vendor since 2003. The opportunity to select a new software and equipment provider increases our ability to offer increased solutions to the public. These solutions may include: remote employee monitoring and access, permit renewals through credit

card auto-renewals, online validation system, group billing for hourly parking, and enhanced shared/group account use.

Proposals Received

Proposals included software and equipment that is cloud-based and meets PCI and DSS (Payment Card Industry Data Security Standard) compliance. Equipment has transitioned to barcodes which will reduce equipment failures due to jams, and allow for multiple permit credential options. Software offers ability for staff to directly configure.

Difference in solutions

- T2 Systems proposal was inclusive of all work items: software, equipment, restriping, directional signage, electrical and conduit. Software allows for permits sold online to be immediately active based on the credential sold, and would allow for permits to be setup for monthly credit card renewals. Staff is familiar with software as vendor is the current provider of our parking management software.
- Traffic and Safety proposal included PARCS equipment and setup only. All conduit and electrical would have to be sourced through another proposal. Similar to existing system where permits sold are transferred into the PARCS software.

Proposal Comparison

Three proposals were received. Only one of the proposals included a response for all work items identified in the RFP. The other two proposals were for PARCS equipment only and conduit/electrical installation only.

In order to reduce operating two separate systems and to ensure consistency for all operations and end-user experiences, the Old Town parking garage equipment was included in the RFP as an optional response. This project will include a conduit, electrical, equipment purchases and software.

	T2 Systems, Inc	Traffic & Safety Control Systems	Windemuller
Hardy Two-way Traffic Conversion			
One-time: Paint, demolition, reconstruction	\$ 7,575.00		
Equipment to remove in-lane transactions is required			
Project Total	\$ 7,575.00	\$ -	\$ -
Hardy PARCS Equipment and Installation			
One-time: Implementation and Installation	\$ 122,175.00	\$ 44,005.00	
One-time: Hardware Purchase (2 Entry, 2 CC Exit, 2 POF, 1 Central Cashier, 6 Gates, 6 AVI Readers, 15 Door Controllers)	\$ 191,028.00	\$ 223,845.00	
One-time: Electrical and Conduit Installation	\$ 24,550.00		\$ 33,729.00
Upfront and ongoing: Access Credentials (AVI, Prox)	\$ 10,164.40	\$ 14,000.00	
One-time: Training, Travel, Shipping	\$ 9,500.00	\$ 2,900.00	
One-time: Misc	\$ -	\$ 5,050.00	
Recurring: Subscriptions (5 year billed annually) - Software, Hardware, Credit Card, Intercom	\$ 66,540.00	\$ 47,880.00	
Project Total	\$ 423,957.40	\$ 337,680.00	\$ 33,729.00
Value Added: Old Town PARCS Equipment and Installation			
One-time: Implementation and Installation	\$ 33,295.00	\$ 30,920.00	
One-time: Hardware Purchase (2 Entry, 2 CC Exit, 2 POF, 1 Central Cashier, 6 Gates, 6 AVI Readers, 15 Door Controllers)	\$ 98,650.00	\$ 190,525.00	
One-time: Electrical and Conduit Installation			
One-time: Training, Travel, Shipping		\$ 2,435.00	
One-time: Misc		\$ 4,320.20	
Recurring: Subscriptions (5 year billed annually) - Software, Hardware, Credit Card, Intercom	\$ 66,540.00	\$ 45,360.00	
Project Total	\$ 198,485.00	\$ 273,560.20	\$ -
Combined Project Total	\$ 630,017.40	\$ 611,240.20	\$ 33,729.00

The motion before you is to approve the more-or-less pricing with contingency based on the proposals received. All final pricing include conduit and electrical runs with review of the City Engineer will be completed prior to City Commission approval. This item has been tentatively placed on the City Commission agenda for their February 6, 2023 meeting.

Recommended Motion: That the DDA Board of Directors recommend the City Commission execute a contract with T2 Systems, Inc. for the Hardy Parking Garage equipment and installation more-or-less of \$400,000 and for the Old Town Parking Garage equipment and installation more-or-less of \$150,000 subject to approval and to its substance by the City Manager and its form by the City Attorney, and to amend the parking management software service to increase the software contract more-or-less of \$150,000 with funds available in the Auto Parking System Fund.