

## **Mobility & Parking Advisory Board**

Wednesday, April 3,  
2024

**11:00 a.m.**

2nd Floor Committee,  
Governmental Center  
400 Boardman Avenue  
Traverse City,  
Michigan 49684



The City of Traverse City does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission to, access to, treatment in, or employment in, its programs or activities. City Manager's Office, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan 49684, phone 231-922-4440, TDD/TTY 231-922-4412, VRS 231-421-7008, has been designated to coordinate compliance with the non-discrimination requirements contained in Section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the ADA Coordinator.

If you are planning to attend and you have a disability requiring any special assistance at the meeting and/or if you have any concerns, please immediately notify the ADA Coordinator.

The City of Traverse City and Downtown Development Authority are committed to a dialog that is constructive, respectful and civil. We ask that all individuals interacting verbally or in writing with board members honor these values.

Downtown Development Authority:  
c/o Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
(231) 922-0241  
Web: [www.parking.downtowntc.com](http://www.parking.downtowntc.com)  
303 East State Street  
Traverse City, MI 49684

---

## Welcome to the Parking Advisory Board meeting

# Agenda

	Page
<b>1. CALL TO ORDER</b>	
<b>2. ROLL CALL</b>	
<b>3. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES</b>	
A. Consideration of approving the minutes of the February 7, 2024 meeting (approval recommended) <a href="#">Mobility &amp; Parking Advisory Board - 07 Feb 2024 - Minutes - Pdf</a>	5 - 10
<b>4. OLD BUSINESS</b>	
A. Traverse City Tourism - Trolley Vehicle Request <a href="#">TCT Trolley Vehicle Request - Letter</a>	11 - 12
<b>5. NEW BUSINESS</b>	
A. Discussion on parking permits for non-employees/residents <a href="#">Permits for Non-employees Residents - Memo</a>	13 - 14
B. Discussion on employee parking permits in residential areas <a href="#">Employee permits in residential areas - Memo</a>	15 - 16
<b>6. RECEIVE AND FILE</b>	
A. Status Updates <a href="#">Status Updates - Memo</a>	17
B. Mobility & Parking Advisory Board Terms <a href="#">Advisory Board Member Terms - PDF</a>	19
C. BATA - Fare-free Route 14 <a href="#">BATA Construction Route 14 - Ad</a>	21
D. BATA Bayline <a href="#">Bayline Front - Rack Card</a> <a href="#">Bayline Map - Rack Card</a>	23 - 25
<b>7. PUBLIC COMMENT</b>	
<b>8. ADJOURNMENT</b>	







**Minutes of the  
Mobility & Parking Advisory Board for the Downtown Development Authority  
Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, February 7, 2024**

A regular meeting of the Traverse City Parking Subcommittee of the City of Traverse City was called to order at the 2nd Floor Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan, at 11 a.m.

The following Members were in attendance: Board Vice Chair Scott Hardy, Commissioner Doug Hickman, Board Member Katy Bertodatto, and William Clark

The following Members were absent: None

Chairperson Bertodatto presided at the meeting.

(a) **CALL TO ORDER**

(b) **ROLL CALL**

Chairperson Bertodatto called the meeting to order at 11:01 AM.

(c) **CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES**

- (1) Consideration of approving the minutes of the December 6, 2023 meeting (approval recommended).

Committee member Knaus was resigned prior to the meeting. Program formatting is including him in the minutes.

that the minutes of the December 6, 2023 meeting be approved.

Moved by Doug Hickman, Seconded by Scott Hardy

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Doug Hickman, Katy Bertodatto, and William Clark

**Absent:** Todd Knaus

**CARRIED. 4-0-1 on a recorded vote**

(d) **OLD BUSINESS**

- (1) Circulator & Trolley (DDA Board Study Session)

(e) **NEW BUSINESS**

- (1) Nominate Vice-chair & Board Member Terms

Bertodatto would like to see additional participation in the Board.

that Scott Hardy be appointed to the vice-chair position of the Advisory Board.

Moved by Katy Bertodatto, Seconded by Doug Hickman

**Yes:** Scott Hardy, Doug Hickman, Katy Bertodatto, and William Clark

**Absent:** None

**CARRIED. 4-0-0 on a recorded vote**

- (2) Parking Structure Repairs and Parking Rates Discussion (Discussion recommended by DDA Board)

VanNess provided an update to the Advisory Board that permit rates will be discussed with the DDA Board Finance Committee to ensure the parking structure restoration repairs from bids due on February 8, 2024 are covered in the Hardy and Old Town budgets.

(f) **UPDATES**

- (1) Status Updates

**Fifth Street Timed Parking**

VanNess provided a brief update on items identified in the memo; Fifth Street Survey results will be provided to support installing 2-hour signage and both the Cromwell Drive and timed loading zones items will be discussed with the Traffic Committee.

**Circulator Discussion**

- Bertodatto walked the committee through the past year and steps taken to review the circulator and asked for discussion regarding next steps or a revised version: 1) not recommended in the Transportation Demand Management Study, 2) case-studies provided have transportation of other funding sources, 3) \$1M+ is a lot of money for a downtown circulator, 4) reducing parking fees at Old Town have not increased utilization.
- Hardy commented that accessibility by the aging is imperative for them to come downtown.
- Hickman commented that the goal has been to work on a downtown

circulator

- The committee requested that a letter be sent to Traverse City Tourism asked to participate as a funding partner in order to add a trolley to the existing fare-free Bayline route.

[Status Updates - Memo](#)

(g) **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

(h) **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Bertodatto adjourned the meeting at 12:22 PM.

---

Katy Bertodatto, Chairperson

Draft







## Memorandum

---

To: Mobility & Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: February 2, 2024  
Re: Status Updates

### **Circulator**

The DDA Board held their Study Session on Friday, February 2, 2024. The Board did not have a quorum; however, BATA did provide an update on Bayline service during the MDOT Grandview Parkway project and the Circulator. I have attached the TDM appendices related to circulator information for reference. Additionally, we follow-up each time information related to a circulator or trolley is mentioned. As a reminder, we have communicated with the following entries:

Crystal Lake Express – Started as a free circulator in downtown Frankfort during Covid. The bus was purchased with grant funds. Operations were weekends only. The bus is currently fee-based and operated within the current Benzie Bus fleet as part of the dial-a-ride service.

The Breeze – The trolley is owned and operated by The Lowcountry Regional Transportation Authority. The trolley services Hilton Head Island free for weekend seasonal service from April through Labor Day. Service is supported by tourism.

Charleston – The trolley is operated by CARTA (Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority). The trolley connects 3 sections of Charleston to downtown for free. The service is supported by the tourism fees/taxes from cruise ships.

Petoskey – The DDA was gifted a trolley bus that was purchased by Stafford's hotel. The bus is operated seasonally during specific times connecting the seasonal visitors in the Petoskey and State Park area.

Oxford Township – In partnership with Lake Orion Township, they operate an express trolley between the two townships. This effort is sponsored by their DDAs. Operation is only on specified days during specified times.

### **Fifth Street Residential Parking Surveys**

The Traffic Committee meets Thursday, February 8, 2024. A recommendation has been sent to add 2-hour parking signs with residential permits exempt in the 500 blk of Fifth St. Residents responded 78% in favor of implementing signage and permits.



**Traverse City  
Downtown Development Authority**

March 18, 2024

Traverse City Tourism  
c/o Trevor Tkach  
via email: [trevor@traversecity.com](mailto:trevor@traversecity.com)

RE: Trolley Vehicle Purchase

Over the past 12 months, the DDA Mobility & Parking Advisory Board (MPAB) consisting of DDA Board Members and Members-at-large have studied a downtown circulator and non-bus vehicle options. The MPAB considered all guests of downtown from residents, employees, and visitors. The study included considerations from the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Study related to area specific circulator routes, reduced fees to employees of downtown businesses, and increased non-hassle accessibility of downtown residents and visitors.

The dedicated circulator route is not supported in case studies of the TDM and is estimated to cost over \$1M in annual operating expenses. The DDA supports the recommendation from Bay Area Transportation Authority (BATA) that additional outreach, public engagement, and economic feasibility study would be needed before moving a dedicated route forward.

The MPAB has prioritized connecting residents and visitors to downtown by utilizing BATA's fare-free Bayline route that services east (Woodland Creek) to west (Meijer). In addition to this route, BATA anticipates launching a fare-free north (BATA Transfer Center) to south (new BATA campus) route summer 2024. These fare-free routes may appeal to those visiting the Grand Traverse Region. Stops along both routes will connect neighborhoods and business districts to hotels and restaurants. These services are advantageous to TCT's membership.

Many communities are investing in old-fashioned trolley vehicles to enhance the user experience. Having these vehicles on routes draw visibility to the public transportation network and options. They are also eye catching and provide a great photo opportunity. The base price of each trolley vehicle is \$287,000. You can experience trolley services in our region in Petoskey or the Crystal Lake Express that services Frankfort and Beulah.

303 E. State St. , Ste. C  
Traverse City, MI 49684  
231-922-2050  
1  
[dda.downtowntc.com](http://dda.downtowntc.com)

RECOMMENDATION: The Downtown Development Authority is requesting Traverse City Tourism participate in funding the purchase of a trolley vehicle(s) to be gifted to Bay Area Transportation Authority for use on their fare-free routes.

Thank you for your consideration,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Nicole VanNess". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Nicole" being the most prominent part.

Nicole VanNess  
Transportation Mobility Director

Enc. Low Floor Carriage Trolley

Copy: Harry Burkholder, DDA Interim-CEO



## Memorandum

---

To: Mobility & Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Re: April 1, 2024  
Date: New Business – Discussion on parking permits for non-employees/residents

Historically, there has never been a method for vetting and verifying applicant information for purchasing a downtown permit. The parking permit program was originally designed for downtown employees, but as our downtown has changed, the program has morphed to include residents, savvy tourists, and storage.

There have been requests for the following permit types. The discussion will be high-level to categorize the uses and possible rates. This item will come back to the advisory board for additional discussion.

- Discuss rates for vehicle storage where vehicles are not leaving the parking structures and are covered for extended periods of time.
- Discuss rates for business that will reuse/share passes for non-employees/residents
- Discuss rates for hotels to purchase permits for use by guests

### Vehicle Storage

This item was first brought to the DDA Board in September 2019, and the City Commission in October 2019. Over the years, we continue to see an increase in permits purchased for the parking garages for the purpose of storing vehicles. They have identified that it is more cost effective to store their car in one of the garages versus a winter storage facility. While we see increased storage in the winter, it is not uncommon to drive through the garages, and see covered vehicles in the summer. Our office fields short-term storage questions from travelers who have determined it is cheaper to purchase a one month permit than pay to park at the airport for one week.

The following is the recommended ordinance amendment requested in 2019. At the time a commissioner asked that the storage rates and parking permit rates be reconsidered rather than a restriction on storage. Recommended Ordinance Amendment:

480.03 - Parking on public property.

- (a) *Parking prohibited:* Unless otherwise allowed by the City Manager, no person shall park or place a vehicle, boat or any other object in any City parking lot [or parking garage](#) for the principal purpose of

displaying such vehicle, boat or object for sale, for storage or for advertising purposes.

(1) Residents with vehicles registered to properties within the downtown business districts defined in Section 298.04 shall be exempt from storage regulations.

- (b) *Enforcement; penalty:* The uniformed employees of the Traverse City Parking Services or police officers are authorized to issue notices of violations and dispose of violations of this section. The civil fine for a violation of this section is \$15 for each offense. A separate offense shall be deemed committed on each day during or on which a violation or noncompliance occurs or continues. The processing of violations and nonpayment of fines shall be handled pursuant to Chapter 488.

(c) Definitions. For the purpose of this chapter:

(1) Storage means any vehicle that has a parking permit that has not moved in ninety-six (96) hours.

### **Transferrable Permits**

In April 2022, the City Commission approved an ordinance amendment that required permits to be registered and used by the registered resident, business or employee; and eliminate the shared use by short-term parkers or reselling of parking. The intent of the parking permit program was never to resell parking permits that are offered at a reduced rate. The following options are available for businesses: 1) validate their customer's parking, 2) have their customers purchase their own parking permit, 3) direct customers to pay the hourly rates or 4) purchase shared account permits. Many of the current hosts or even guests have been purchasing 1-month parking garage permits for \$50 (Hardy) or \$30 (Old Town) regardless of their stay duration as it is the best value.

### **Hotel Guests**

There has been a recent inquiry into the rate that would be charged to hotels for their guests to self-park or for transferrable permits for valet. The City does not contract for reserved spaces or have a rate for bulk business permits. I have reached out to Grand Rapids to see if they offer hotel agreements for parking.



## Memorandum

---

To: Mobility & Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Re: April 1, 2024  
Date: New Business – Discussion on employee permits in residential areas

In October of 2019, we implemented the residential parking permit (RPP) program which provided permits to residents to exceed posted time restrictions in residential areas. RPP was approved by City Commission after a public engagement process that obtained feedback from all neighborhoods. Resident input identified the top 3 concerns to be:

- Residential Parking
  - Access for residents
  - Access for resident's guests
- Overnight Parking
  - Overnight parking for residents
  - Overnight parking for resident's guests
  - Overnight parking for short-term rental properties
- Commuter Parking
  - Daytime access for non-residents and residents working or doing business in a residential area
  - Daytime access for businesses working in residential areas (home healthcare workers, contractors, teachers, etc.)

The City Commission adopted the RPP ordinance and zones to be specific to resident access near their properties with modifications to the RPP program to be recommended at a later date. The current program or phase 1 includes:

- No Fee - Virtual Permits.
- Not Required. Opt-in Program.
- Requirements
  - Vehicle must be registered to a resident who resides on an RPP block.
- No Limit to the number of permits, as long as, the requirements are met.
- Permit Benefits
  - Allows resident to exceed posted restricted time limit signs
  - Residents can park on-street to accommodate their guests
- Permit Restrictions
  - Not valid in metered zones

- Not valid for RV/Motorhome, Boat/Tool Trailers, Motor Coaches/Oversized Vehicles
- Who Benefits
  - Residents and their guests
  - Tenants/Renters and their guests

The following instances have been brought to the attention of the MPAB and other city departments:

- Boardman neighborhood may start to experience overflow parking from Commongrounds who was notified of non-compliance of parking on unimproved surfaces.
- Boardman neighborhood will have a change in parking needs with the sale of the TCAPS administration building construction and future use.
- Central neighborhood has seen spill-over parking from new developments on the west end of downtown.
- Cromwell Drive spill-over parking from businesses

The discussion will determine if the public engagement process with residents will be initiated for phase 2 of the RPP program. This item will come back to the advisory board for additional discussion.





## Memorandum

---

To: Mobility & Parking Advisory Board  
From: Nicole VanNess, Transportation Mobility Director  
Date: March 29, 2024  
Re: Status Updates

### **Fifth Street Residential Parking Surveys**

The Traffic Committee has approved a 90-day Traffic Control Order to install 2-HR signage. Residents have received communications on the residential permit program and how to obtain a residential permit.

### **Cromwell Drive & Timed Loading Zones**

I have met with Mike from House of Dank. HOD has attempted to purchase property in the vicinity of their business for employee and customer parking. They have the need for 3-4 employee parking spaces per day plus additional parking for customers. We have another meeting set later this month to continue discussions.

### **Park Street Public Restrooms**

Due to damage and loitering, the Park Street public restrooms hours of operation have been updated to Monday-Friday from 7:00 AM-4:30 PM. Any one from the public that needs access after-hours may obtain a temporary card from the parking office.





## Mobility & Parking Advisory Board

---

Advisory Board terms as of March 15, 2024

Current Board Members	Term End	
Bertodatto, Katy - Chair	09/2026	DDA Board
Clark, William (Bill)	12/2024	At-Large Transportation Authority
Hardy, Scott	09/2024	DDA Board
Hickman, Doug	12/2025	At-Large Property & Business Owner
Open		At-Large
Gary Howe	03/2026	DDA Board Resident
Open		At-Large





Route **14** will be fare-free during spring 2024

E. Front St. Construction



Find updates at [www.bata.net/2024](http://www.bata.net/2024)



WHERE SUN MEETS SHORE.





bata.net/bayline

2024 MDOT Parkway Project

bata.net/villageloops



Effective: March 11, 2024

# Temporary bayline 14 Service

## Bayline Schedule



	TIME	DURATION
Monday - Friday	7am - 10pm	buses every 20 minutes
Saturdays	7am - 10pm	buses every 20-30 minutes
Sundays	9am - 9pm	buses every 30-40 minutes

**14** Operates Monday-Friday 6:30am - 7:30pm with buses every two hours.\*  
\*Service levels are planned to slightly increase in May.

## Temporary Changes during E Front St Construction

- **Meijer Bayline** will circulate from downtown and Hall Street west to Meijer.
- **Woodland Creek Bayline** will circulate east of Hall Street including downtown Traverse City.
- **Stops at E Front / Rose Street and E Front / Garfield Ave will be closed.**
- The westbound bayline 14 stop at the Front St / Barlow Ave shelter will be relocated to **State St / Barlow Ave**.
- The eastbound stop at Front St / Barlow will be in front of the **Hagerty Center**.
- The westbound stop at the Front St / Milliken shelter will be relocated to the **Dennos Museum** at NMC.
- A westbound bayline 14 stop will be added at **Titus Ave** at the Civic Center.
- **14 to Acme** and the airport will be **fare-free** during the construction, giving riders more bus options!

Note: construction can modify service at any time. Please check updates at [www.bata.net/2024](http://www.bata.net/2024).



BATA.NET/2024



GOOGLE.COM/MAPS



TRANSITAPP.COM



BATABUSTRACKER.COM

231.941.2324



Bay Area Transportation Authority

bata.net





Bayline loop west to Meijer

Bayline loop east to Woodland Creek



Scan QR codes for all construction updates and live bus tracking



BATABUSTRACKER.COM

BATA.NET/2024



All Bayline and Loop uses are equipped with a passenger-loaded, front-mounted bike rack that holds three standard bicycles. There is no extra charge to bring your bike. Rack space is first come, first serve.